



MINUTES

**Ordinary Council meeting
Monday, 29 May 2023**

Order of Business

1	Opening karakia	3
2	Apologies	3
3	Public forum	3
3.1	Mr Grahame Benvie - The Domain.....	3
3.2	Mr Christopher Pattison - The Domain and Memorial Park Development.....	4
3.3	Ms Margaret Murray-Benge - Bethlehem Road Kerb and Channelling	5
4	Acceptance of late items	6
4.1	Appointment of Ngā Potiki ā Tamapahore Trust Board representative to the Wastewater Management Review Committee.....	6
5	Confidential business to be transferred into the open	6
6	Change to the order of business	6
7	Confirmation of minutes	6
7.1	Minutes of the Council meeting held on 1 May 2023	6
8	Receipt of minutes for information	7
	Nil	
9	Declaration of conflicts of interest	7
10	Deputations, presentations, petitions	7
	Nil	
11	Recommendations from other committees	7
11.1	Nga Poutiriao o Mauao - Membership	7
12	Business	7
12.1	Letter of Expectation for Te Manawataki o Te Papa Limited.....	7
12.2	Traffic & Parking Bylaw Amendment 44	8
12.3	Parking Rule Change	8
12.4	SmartGrowth Leadership Group (Joint Committee) Membership and Terms of Reference	10
13	Discussion of late items	10
13.1	Approval of extraordinary meeting - 6 June 2023	10
14	Public excluded session	11
14.1	Public Excluded Minutes of the Council meeting held on 1 May 2023	11
14.2	Exemption to Open Competition - Maintenance and Operations Services.....	11
14.3	Request for Management Reserve for Building our future - Cameron Road, Te Papa Stage 1	11
14.4	Marine Precinct Lot Purchase - 35 Hikuwai Place	11
14.5	Appointment of Ngā Potiki ā Tamapahore Trust Board representative to the Wastewater Management Review Committee.....	12
12	Business (continued)	12
12.5	Draft User Fees and Charges 2023/24 - Hearings.....	12
15	Closing karakia	16

**MINUTES OF TAURANGA CITY COUNCIL
ORDINARY COUNCIL MEETING
HELD AT THE BAY OF PLENTY REGIONAL COUNCIL CHAMBERS, REGIONAL HOUSE,
1 ELIZABETH STREET, TAURANGA
ON MONDAY, 29 MAY 2023 AT 9.30AM**

- PRESENT:** Commission Chair Anne Tolley, Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston, Commissioner Stephen Selwood, Commissioner Bill Wasley
- IN ATTENDANCE:** Marty Grenfell (Chief Executive), Nic Johansson (General Manager: Infrastructure), Christine Jones (General Manager: Strategy, Growth & Governance), Gareth Wallis (General Manager: City Development & Partnerships), Anne Blakeway (Manager: City Partnerships), Brendan Bisley (Director of Transport), Reece Wilkinson (Parking Strategy Manager), Josh Logan (Team Leader: Corporate Planning), Coral Hair (Manager: Democracy & Governance Services), Sarah Drummond (Governance Advisor), Anahera Dinsdale (Governance Advisor), Janie Storey (Governance Advisor)

1 OPENING KARAKIA

Commissioner Shad Rolleston opened the meeting with a karakia.

2 APOLOGIES

Nil

3 PUBLIC FORUM

A copy of the documents tabled from submitters at the meeting can be viewed on Tauranga City Council's (TCC) website.

3.1 Mr Grahame Benvie - The Domain

Mr Benvie noted:

Key points

- He had been a resident of the area for 38 years, was a regular user of the Domain and familiar with its usage over that time.
- Prepared the change.org "Hands off Tauranga Domain and Baypark Speedway" petition which 1,060 people had signed, and administered two face book groups that had been set up to save the Domain.
- His vision for the Domain was to keep it as it was, an open green space where people of all ages and abilities within the community could get exercise.
- This was the last open greenspace in the city area and was well away from the traffic noise of the city.
- The submitter made reference to the Joni Mitchell song and quoted the chorus which included - *They paved paradise and put up a parking lot and you don't know what you've got until its gone*. The lyrics were written while Joni was peering out of the hotel she was staying at in Hawaii and instead of seeing the beach all she saw was an asphalt parking lot. The song reflected on why humans take nature for granted.
- The stadium would result in losing the athletic track which was well used as it was in the central city and the immaculate croquet lawns would become a carpark.

- Mr Benvie advised he had attended a presentation by Priority One and was astounded to learn that a survey of community usage had never been done when preparing the preliminary business case.
- Mr Benvie considered it was clear when putting the case together they had no idea of the range of uses and no one came to ask their opinion. He believed this was shameful and ignored the unspoken wishes of thousands of people in the city.
- Mr Benvie noted that if the proposal did not proceed the work done to date would be a huge waste of money, especially when there should have been opportunities for users to have their say.
- The new stadiums at Dunedin and Wellington were built on land that was not the last open greenspace in their cities and they had the infrastructure to get people to and from the venues. Tauranga currently required the road be closed off for big events and that would likely continue.
- The citizens of Tauranga had every right to be outraged when they learn of this proposed stadium being built on the last green open space within the city.
- Mr Benvie was baffled as to why the Council did not confirm they wanted a business case for the Blake Park option at the same time as the Domain.
- The submitter asked that Commissioners remember the money from Council was from assets that had been paid for in the past and requested them to please take time to consider and consult earnestly before rubber stamping the proposal.

Discussion points raised

- Commissioner Tolley advised the submitter that at the 1 May 2023 Council meeting, they had asked staff to look at the funding and operating mechanisms for the Domain and noted that no decision was made at that meeting to include it in the next Long-Term Plan.

Attachments

- 1 Tabled Item - Grahame Benvie

3.2 Mr Christopher Pattison - The Domain and Memorial Park Development

Mr Pattison noted:

Key points

- Mr Pattison was a voluntary member of the Tauranga Model Engineers Club, which ran a model railway and provided a fun rail ride escape at a reasonable price, catering for an excess of 1,000 children and parents most of the days they operated.
- The Club had won a number of awards for the public service they provided and the track was considered one of the most popular tracks in New Zealand.
- The Club had become aware of the possible redevelopment of the Queen Elizabeth Youth Centre in the future and were concerned that this development may encroach upon part of the area that they leased.
- The track had taken a long time and a lot of money to create and any alternations must be properly engineered for safety reasons. The tracks could not be moved easily.
- While the Club realised that ongoing upgrades were inevitable and necessary within the city, members were in a state of uncertainty with the proposal and they were unable to carry out any maintenance on the buildings or track until they were secure in their future of the site.
- Members want to be involved in the planning of this project so they could also plan changes to their assets as these could not be made overnight.
- An invitation was issued to the Commissioners to visit the facilities so they could see for themselves and note the hard work put into it by members.
- In relation to the proposed changes to the Tauranga Domain, the submitter considered that this was less than ideal and would create more problems than it would solve.
- Mr Pattison asked that the Council think outside the square and, if a venue for rugby, soccer and conferences was needed, then start from a clean slate. Mr Pattison, suggested the

stadium be put on a greenfield site, where there was adequate room for support services, future expansion and easy access.

- Mr Pattison suggested that the land adjacent to Bell Road would be an ideal location as it was close to SH2, west of the future Te Tumu township, and could be served by the Pāpāmoa interchange offramp that was currently being built.

Discussion points raised

- Commissioner Tolley thanked Mr Pattison for the invitation to visit their facility saying that they would take up the offer. She was not aware of the impact on the Model Engineering Club as suggested and noted that they would be also considering the fountain and future plans for that area.
- It was noted that a site assessment of various locations had been undertaken a number of years ago and it was requested that this be provided to Mr Pattison for his information.

Attachments

- 1 Tabled item - Chris Pattison - Stadium Tauranga Domain
- 2 Tabled item - Chris Pattison - Stadium Tauranga Domain

3.3 Ms Margaret Murray-Benge - Bethlehem Road Kerb and Channelling

Ms Murray-Benge noted:

Key points

- The group in the audience accompanying the submitters consisted of residents living in the Bethlehem Country Club and Shores Lifestyle Village who lived there because it was flat and easy to move around for walking and cycling.
- The cycle/walkway currently being built on the paper road from Carmichael Road was beautiful and the sculpture would be admired and hopefully stop anti-social behaviour from occurring on the path.
- The submitters were concerned that there needed to be better pedestrian access to the new path, with the footpath on Bethlehem Road needing to be continued along Carmichael Road.
- While the work was on the list to be done, it had not happened and instead humps had been installed that the cars had to bump over, which was an invitation for anti-social behaviour.
- There was a suggestion of a pedestrian crossing with two areas to cross the road, but the path needed to be completed to meet the new paper road. Ms Murray-Benge said that this would be perfect and they were asking the Council to do that.

Mr Ian Travers noted:

- The submitter noted that he supported the completion of the section of Bethlehem Road from the Country Club to the Marae and beyond and the associated widening kerb and channelling that had been on the radar for many years.
- The work was long overdue with the increased usage and housing developments to ensure safety for all users.
- On the undeveloped section of road, there was a discharge of pedestrians from the Bethlehem Country Club, the Shores Retirement Village, Hangarau Marae and the general housing estate at the end of the road.
- The number of residents had increased dramatically in the last 10 years with 170 homes in the Country Club and 200 in the Shores and, with a further 58 units and 25 dementia units approved, it would increase the future traffic and mobile carers.
- There would be an increase in the number of vehicle movements with construction vehicles over the next few years.
- Council needed to be cognisant of the number of older residents living in the area, including their need for ease of access, along with regular ambulance and carers visits and to make the road as safe as possible.
- With tourism at the Marae increasing, the area should have the best access possible.

- The roading was narrow and the berms quickly turned to a quagmire. It was not much to ask for an attractive and functional road without delay.

Discussion points raised

- The Commissioners thanked the submitters for their comments and noted it was a familiar story with the works on the books, that kept getting pushed off.
- Staff had indicated that the work was high on the radar, but Commissioners would find out how high and make sure to give residents a clear written picture of the timeline for the works proceeding.

Attachments

- 1 Tabled Item - Margaret Murray-Benge
- 2 Tabled Item - Ian Travers

4 ACCEPTANCE OF LATE ITEMS

4.1 Appointment of Ngā Potiki ā Tamapahore Trust Board representative to the Wastewater Management Review Committee

RESOLUTION CO7/23/1

Moved: Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston

Seconded: Commissioner Bill Wasley

That the late tabled report "Appointment of Ngā Potiki ā Tamapahore Trust Board representative to the Wastewater Management Review Committee" be accepted for consideration in the public excluded part of the meeting.

CARRIED

5 CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS TO BE TRANSFERRED INTO THE OPEN

Nil

6 CHANGE TO THE ORDER OF BUSINESS

Nil

7 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

7.1 Minutes of the Council meeting held on 1 May 2023

RESOLUTION CO7/23/2

Moved: Commissioner Bill Wasley

Seconded: Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston

That the minutes of the Council meeting held on 1 May 2023 be confirmed as a true and correct record.

CARRIED

8 RECEIPT OF MINUTES FOR INFORMATION

Nil

9 DECLARATION OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Nil

10 DEPUTATIONS, PRESENTATIONS, PETITIONS

Nil

11 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM OTHER COMMITTEES

11.1 Nga Poutiriao o Mauao - Membership

Staff Christine Jones, General Manager: Strategy, Growth & Governance
Coral Hair, Manager: Democracy & Governance Services

RESOLUTION CO7/23/3

Moved: Commissioner Bill Wasley

Seconded: Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston

That the Council:

- (a) Receives the report "Nga Poutiriao o Mauao - Membership".
- (b) Appoints Alison Law, Manager: Spaces and Places to Ngā Poutiriao o Mauao as the first Tauranga City Council representative if one Commissioner is absent to ensure a quorum.

CARRIED

12 BUSINESS

12.1 Letter of Expectation for Te Manawataki o Te Papa Limited

Staff Anne Blakeway, Manager: City Partnerships

Discussion points raised

- Objectives – add to third bullet point - enable *people from around* the region to attend a range of events and activities.
- Objectives – broaden the fifth bullet point to include the whole city centre not just the civic precinct.
- Relationship between Council and the Te Manawataki o Te Papa Limited Board - as elected members did not have the right to attend CCO Board meetings, it was suggested that the second bullet point stating they can attend be removed. The 'governance to governance' relationship should occur outside of the usual board processes, as with the other CCOs. Some reference to the relationship with Otamataha Trust needed to be included in this section.

RESOLUTION CO7/23/4

Moved: Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston

Seconded: Commissioner Stephen Selwood

That the Council:

- (a) Receives the report "Letter of Expectation for Te Manawataki o Te Papa Limited".

- (b) Approves the Letter of Expectation from Tauranga City Council to the Board of Te Manawataki o Te Papa Limited, as amended. (Attachment 1).

CARRIED

12.2 Traffic & Parking Bylaw Amendment 44

Staff Nic Johansson, General Manager: Infrastructure Services
Brendon Bisley, Director of Transportation

In response to questions

- The changes were being made as a result of requests from residents, with individual changes outside of these properties being discussed with the business owners.
- There would be a full tidy up of the bylaw at the end of the works on Cameron Road, but as a result of the recent consultation minor changes were needed now.
- The consultation on the Cameron Road multimodal project commenced two years ago and had been ongoing for the past 12 months. Now that the construction had begun, further discussions were being held with owners as the work progressed.
- The plans were live on the website so were available at all times for people to look at. Any changes were communicated directly back to those affected.

Discussion points raised

- It was noted that people were not aware of the availability of parking in the off peak times between 11th and 12th Avenue and it was suggested that a blanket mail out be provided for Cameron Road residents and businesses once the works had finished, making it clear what parking was and was not allowed.
- Commissioner Tolley noted that the Public Transport Joint Committee was seeking a 10 year master plan, with full time bus lanes planned along Cameron Road, therefore the Council would need to make a decision as to whether or not all of the parking was taken out, as there needed to be a signal given that the Council would be working towards implementing the master plan.
- The Cameron Road multimodal project was about the changing face of Tauranga City, and with increased intensification planned along this main route, it was likely to be a different road in 10 years' time, and residents and businesses needed to be taken along on that journey of transformation.

RESOLUTION CO7/23/5

Moved: Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston

Seconded: Commissioner Bill Wasley

That the Council:

- (a) Receives the report "Traffic & Parking Bylaw Amendment 44".
- (b) Adopts the proposed amendments to the Traffic and Parking Bylaw (2012) Attachments as per Appendix B, relating to minor changes for general safety, operational or amenity purposes, to become effective on or after 30 May 2023 subject to appropriate signs and road markings being implemented.

CARRIED

12.3 Parking Rule Change

Staff Nic Johansson, General Manager: Infrastructure Services
Reece Wilkinson, Parking Strategy Manager
Brendan Bisley, Director of Transportation

Key points

- The change recommended was for paid parking to end during the week at 5pm and all day Saturday to ensure that the parking worked as it should within commuter hours and to relax them for those coming into the CBD for recreation.
- Consultation had been carried out with all parties.
- There had been a 17% increase in paid parking with many commuters parking 1-2 hours on the road. The turnover was as expected.
- Business owners had seen a drop in footfall outside of business hours.

In response to questions

- There was still work to be done to bring people into town after business hours.
- Staff were looking at an alternative method to use the leased parks in the parking buildings so there were more parks available at the lower levels at the off peak times. 43% of the bays were reserved for leaseholders, with the biggest occupancy rates on Tuesday and Wednesday.
- It would be useful to monitor the parking buildings to see any changes over time and to understand the occupancy of leased bays and to more efficiently use these bays.
- In response to a suggestion that staff liaise with Mainstreet to understand what their needs were and to hear how the hospitality sector was tracking, it was noted that staff had met with Mainstreet who were aware of the changes.
- Parking impacts on businesses would continue to be monitored over the next few months as the rebuilds in the CBD commenced.
- In response to a query regarding the use of the Dive Crescent and Cliff Road carparks in the evening, it was noted that Cliff Road was a pay park and if someone parked before the 7 pm cut-off they were able to leave at any time. As that area was residential it was not encouraged as a parking area in the later evening, as the residents would not want cars to be leaving in the early hours of the morning.

Discussion points raised

- A further recommendation was added asking staff to report on the effectiveness of the changes in six months' time.

RESOLUTION CO7/23/6

Moved: Commissioner Bill Wasley

Seconded: Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston

That the Council:

- (a) Receives the report "Parking Rule Change".
- (b) Approves the following changes to the Traffic and Parking Bylaw 2012 to come into effect on 5 June 2023
 - (i) Clause 12,13.1 and 14, attachment 7.14 - Change the paid parking finish time to 5pm weekdays (currently 6pm).
 - (ii) Clause 12,13.1 and 14, attachment 7.14 - Introduce free parking on Saturdays in the City Centre.
- (c) Receives a report in six months' time outlining the effectiveness of the parking changes and the utilisation of the parking buildings.

CARRIED

12.4 SmartGrowth Leadership Group (Joint Committee) Membership and Terms of Reference

Staff Christine Jones, General Manager: Strategy, Growth & Governance

In response to questions

- It was noted that there had been some confusion from iwi regarding the appointment of tangata whenua representatives and it was agreed that this be raised as part of the next strategic review.

RESOLUTION CO7/23/7

Moved: Commissioner Bill Wasley

Seconded: Commissioner Stephen Selwood

That the Council:

- (a) Receives the report "SmartGrowth Leadership Group (Joint Committee) Membership and Terms of Reference".
- (b) Approves the SmartGrowth Leadership Group (Joint Committee) Agreement 2023 and SmartGrowth Leadership Group Committee Terms of Reference (attachment 1).
- (c) Notes that the recruitment process for the Independent Chair position is underway.
- (d) Reviews the appointment process of tangata whenua representatives as part of the SmartGrowth Strategic review.

CARRIED

13 DISCUSSION OF LATE ITEMS

13.1 Approval of extraordinary meeting - 6 June 2023

Accepts the following late item/s for consideration at the meeting:

- Extraordinary Meeting 6 June 2023

The above item was not included in the original agenda because it was not available at the time the agenda was issued. Discussion on the 2023-24 Dog Registration fees cannot be delayed until the next scheduled meeting of the Council because a decision was required in regard to this item.

RESOLUTION CO7/23/8

Moved: Commission Chair Anne Tolley

Seconded: Commissioner Bill Wasley

That the Council:

- (a) Approves an Extraordinary Council meeting be held on Tuesday, 6 June 2023 at the end of the Strategy, Finance and Risk Committee meeting to consider and adopt dog registration fees and charges for the year 1 July 2023 to 30 June 2024.

CARRIED

14 PUBLIC EXCLUDED SESSION

Resolution to exclude the public

RESOLUTION CO7/23/9

Moved: Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston

Seconded: Commissioner Stephen Selwood

That the public be excluded from the following parts of the proceedings of this meeting.

The general subject matter of each matter to be considered while the public is excluded, the reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter, and the specific grounds under section 48 of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution are as follows:

General subject of each matter to be considered	Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter	Ground(s) under section 48 for the passing of this resolution
<p>14.1 - Public Excluded Minutes of the Council meeting held on 1 May 2023</p>	<p>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of deceased natural persons</p> <p>s7(2)(b)(ii) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect information where the making available of the information would be likely unreasonably to prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information</p> <p>s7(2)(i) - The withholding of the information is necessary to enable Council to carry on, without prejudice or disadvantage, negotiations (including commercial and industrial negotiations)</p>	<p>s48(1)(a) - the public conduct of the relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding would exist under section 6 or section 7</p>
<p>14.2 - Exemption to Open Competition - Maintenance and Operations Services</p>	<p>s7(2)(h) - The withholding of the information is necessary to enable Council to carry out, without prejudice or disadvantage, commercial activities</p>	<p>s48(1)(a) - the public conduct of the relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding would exist under section 6 or section 7</p>
<p>14.3 - Request for Management Reserve for Building our future - Cameron Road, Te Papa Stage 1</p>	<p>s7(2)(b)(ii) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect information where the making available of the information would be likely unreasonably to prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information</p>	<p>s48(1)(a) - the public conduct of the relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding would exist under section 6 or section 7</p>
<p>14.4 - Marine Precinct Lot Purchase - 35 Hikuwai Place</p>	<p>s7(2)(b)(ii) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect information where the making available of the information would be likely unreasonably to prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information</p>	<p>s48(1)(a) - the public conduct of the relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding would exist under section 6 or section 7</p>

<p>14.5 - Appointment of Ngā Potiki ā Tamapahore Trust Board representative to the Wastewater Management Review Committee</p>	<p>s7(2)(a) - The withholding of the information is necessary to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of deceased natural persons.</p>	<p>s48(1)(a) - the public conduct of the relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding would exist under section 6 or section 7</p>
--	--	--

CARRIED

At 10.55 am the meeting adjourned.

At 1.24 pm the meeting reconvened.

12 BUSINESS (continued)

12.5 Draft User Fees and Charges 2023/24 - Hearings

Staff Paul Davidson, Chief Financial Officer
Josh Logan, Team Leader: Corporate Planning

The following members of the public spoke to their submission to the Draft User Fees and Charges 2023/24.

A copy of all presentations and documents tabled at the hearing can be viewed on Tauranga City Council's (TCC) website.

(1) Sub No.132 – Mark Beech, Mark Rogers, Tauranga City Basketball and Jenny Kirk Tauranga Volleyball

Key points

Mark Beech, Counsel on behalf of the submitters noted:

- The combined basketball and volleyball club membership was 6,700 with 4,500 playing basketball and 2,200 playing volleyball.
- The sports were significant stakeholders as they were high use consumers of the indoor facilities and were adaptive and proactive organisations.
- While they understood the need to increase fees, the current increases would have a crippling effect on their organisations.
- Tauranga promoted community activities and sports and the clubs noted the many positive outcomes they provided, especially with regards to youth.
- The basketball and volleyball clubs ask that the proposal be rethought as increases of 28% to 50% had a damaging effect on these organisations which represent the community with people of all ages, from youth to the elder players, who were all active members of community.
- They also represented a diverse socio-economic base and diverse ethnic groups and asked the Council to help them to help the community.
- The submitters suggested that Council look at a proper analysis as to what user rates and charges may look like, as it was not an apples for apples comparison when comparing Tauranga with major centres. A more correct analysis would be from a regional perspective, with Hawkes Bay being similar in many ways.
- It was difficult to understand the basis for the increases when the facilities were to remain the same, with no capital improvements being proposed.
- The submitters asked the Council to blunt their pencil to better manage the costs of these facilities, noting that there must be cost savings to be made, and it was not good enough to say the increases were caused by inflation.

- The clubs accept that they would have to pay more, it was a matter of just how much, and if the charges were to be significant, they asked that these be grandparented and not short and sharp hits, as the clubs need the ability to plan, to fundraise and find their own cost savings.
- Volleyball was a voluntary organisation and it would be a significant burden to find additional money in such a short space of time.
- The submitters noted that there was a difference between indoor and outdoor sports and asked that an analysis be done, with the differing rates and changes, as there should be equity across codes, especially in relation to the benefits within the community.
- Basketball was the fastest growing sport in New Zealand at present.
- There were significant differences in the charges, with volleyball being incidental through the secondary schools. These clubs also produced a number of top level athletes each year.
- Both organisations attracted a large number of competitions which meant that there was money and benefits coming into the community. Competitions were becoming harder to run and they would have to hike up entry fees, which could make it prohibitive for some.
- The submitters made a plea for Council to have a firm understanding of what all of the charges were, the timing, the need for time to plan, and for equity and fairness, as it was getting harder and harder to play.
- Mr Rogers noted that there were 50 older basketballers who played walking basketball twice a week.
- Basketball was the barrier at the top of the cliff, rather than the ambulance at the bottom, and the submitters asked that Council did not undersell sport and the benefits it provided to the community.

In response to questions

- Commissioner Tolley apologised to the clubs and noted that there were further recommendations proposed to add to those in the report.
- Commissioners were feeling a bit discombobulated as many of the charges were set by Bay Venues Limited (BVL) but as BVL were not at the meeting to hear the submitters they were unable to address the concerns raised.
- Fairness between the indoor versus outdoor activities would be taken up with staff.
- Tauranga was considered a major city however, Commissioners take the point about the lack of investment over the last 20 years and were trying to address that.
- Council became involved as any balance of costs needed to be made up from ratepayer funding.
- Council would hold further discussions with BVL regarding the state of some of the facilities, the methodology with the comparison of fees with other users and the wider benefit to the community to have organisations maintain activities for residents.
- The dilemma being faced by the Council was that if the fees were not raised, and the facilities were not up to grade, the ratepayers had to fund the balance. It was also noted that BVL did not run at a profit.
- Ms Kirk noted that the volleyball players were charged \$1.20 per activity and an increase of 46% would put them close to what you would pay in Hamilton. It was hard to put a per person rate on each session, with 4,000 players per week it was an insignificant way to look at it. Last year there had been a 5.9% increase after covid and the hall hire was 40% of the volleyball club's annual expenses.
- Bay Park was a fabulous venue and Tauranga was a popular venue for national and regional volleyball tournaments.
- Mr Beech noted that there was the cost to players and the cost to the organisation, and if a family had three children playing a sport, you needed to look at what an increase meant to a family. The clubs had to consider how much of the cost it passed on the players and how to make up the shortfall, so it was a balancing act. The cost of the kit and equipment also needed to be taken into the dynamics for families to play.

- Basketball paid \$100,000 in rental each year.
- The submitters asked where the analysis was that these decisions were being based on. The decision put pressure on the sporting community which had caused the reaction that it was not OK.

(2) Sub No.5 - Julie Batten, Fusion Dance

Key points

- The submitter had run a social dance class at the Elizabeth Street Community Centre for some time.
- The standard of the facility does not reflect the price of other facilities around the country or warrant a 96% increase from January 2024.
- The facilities do not match those at the Arataki Community Centre and the submitter was at a loss to understand why the prices were the same. She also had to pay extra costs for heating, the floor was in poor condition and needed to be relayed to cover the holes and she often had to vacuum and sweep before starting her classes. While she had laid complaints, nothing was ever done as some users did not clean up when leaving.
- Most of the dancers were younger adults that were not high income earners or were parents who had to prioritise the needs of their children. The submitter felt that she could not pass on a 96% increase to them.
- The submitter would need to look at moving to another venue if the price was to rise that much, but as it was a good central location, she did not want to do that.
- The submitter understands that Council were tidying up a mess made by the previous Council and that the town was growing with the ratepayers getting hammered at one end and another so it was not easy to sort.

In response to questions

- The submitter noted that she used the facility because it was central and did not get as many people when using other venues like the Arataki Community Centre.
- A casual class was \$15 and it would not be fair to nearly double that. The new fees would mean that a couple would have to pay \$50 to attend a session.
- Hire costs were currently \$300-400 a month and this would increase to \$600 a month, so there would need to be a big jump to cover those costs.
- Dance provided a social and leisure outlet and was a good mental and physical activity.
- There were between 25-40 participants at the sessions and teachers were employed.
- While it was run as a business, it was not profit making, and the charges were made to cover the costs to dance one night a week.

(3) Sub No.43 – Frances Wilcockson – Matua Majors Leisure Marching Team

Key points

- The leisure marching team were made up of a group of ten 70-80 year old's using the Mount Leisure Sports Centre from mid-January to mid-November each year.
- Currently they paid an affordable weekly fee of \$5.00 which all participants could contribute to. The activities needed to be accessible and affordable.
- The group were rated in the youth category for venue hire fees.
- The group delight in keeping fit in mind, body and soul and news of the increase in the rate was devastating and had affected them markedly, as noted in the points made in the submission.
- They were not affiliated to any association and were a standalone group.
- Consideration had been given to practicing outside at no cost, but having done this in the past when it was cold and wet the practices did not happen and had resulted in people missing too many practices. Due to lack of continuity the team would likely fall apart.
- Community halls were too small as they needed a minimum space equal to a basketball court to accommodate the march plan.

- Looking at similar venues, they would put the Aquinas School venue first, Merivale School second and the Mount Sports Centre third as it was more like a community hall with the bare facilities, hot in the summer, cold in the winter and needed money to sort out the work that was needed.
- The submitter questioned why the Council wanted to align the increased costs in one hit and suggested that small steps be taken so that it did not affect a clubs viability. This was more realistic and in keeping with inflation.
- The group object to possibly being priced out of the market with one 79% increase which had impacted on them to a point where they did not know what was envisaged for them in the long term. The submitter suggested charging the increases over 1-3 years instead of in one hit so that users could plan better for their longevity.
- While some groups had a larger financial base, the marchers were only 10 people who were continually working throughout the year to fundraise so that they could compete in regional and national events with the 1,000 other leisure marchers in New Zealand.
- It was better for the community if they stayed actively involved in healthy activities.
- Cutting down on practice time would not allow the ladies to have the time that they needed to learn the routines.

In response to questions

- In response to a query as to whether the group had applied for community funding, the submitter noted that they had not applied for Council funding as they were not affiliated to any group. They had applied to the Lotteries Commission and Pub Charities to attend competitions with varying success.
- Members paid \$5 per session and they did not want to have to raise that to cater for the increase of hire from \$16.50 to \$29.20 per session. If they did not increase their members contribution they would not have any money left in the kitty for other things.
- The Leisure Centre was totally different to the Aquinas School and Merivale School centre, it was the poor cousin so should not be bracketed with those facilities.

(4) Sub No.27 - Perry Farrell

Key points

- The submitter noted that he wanted to put forward a smaller promoter point of view.
- He was not like the bigger organisations, but still had a number of fixed costs to put on feasible events such as the Beast of a Feast.
- There was a price ticket limit of \$50 imposed by the Council's own policy or the price changed for hiring venues from \$340 to \$3,000 per day.
- Increasing the ticket price limit to \$60 would help a lot to reduce costs as there was a minimum of \$60-80,000 to get festivals off the ground. The current charge had resulted in a lot smaller margins and it had taken a while to bounce back from Covid.
- The submitter noted that a recent festival held on the Tauranga waterfront for 1,000 people was helped by the Council waiving part of venue fee, but then the weather was bad so attendance was not as expected. The fee reduction had helped and they would look at running the event again next year.
- Due to fixed and increasing costs, it was hard to run an event for under \$50 a ticket these days.

In response to questions

- The submitter stressed that Council staff were always very helpful, but noted that there was no change in the level of service provided by the Council for the price difference.

General discussion points raised

- Include four further points to the recommendations to better consider the points raised by submitters.
- A decision was needed for adoption of the schedule by 19 June 2023.
- 95% of the submissions related to facilities operated by Bay Venues Limited, so they needed to

be part of the process.

RESOLUTION CO7/23/10

Moved: Commission Chair Anne Tolley

Seconded: Commissioner Bill Wasley

That the Council:

- (a) Receives the report "Draft User Fees and Charges 2023/24 - Hearings".
- (b) Receives the written submissions on the "Draft User Fees and Charges 2023/24" (**Attachment 2**).
- (c) Receives submission numbers 138 and 139 that were received after submissions closed at 5pm on 24 April 2023.
- (d) Receives the verbal submissions from those submitters that wish to speak to their submission.
- (e) Meets with Bay Venues Limited Board to discuss the submissions.
- (f) Discuss the indoor verses outdoor venue costs and charges with Spaces and Places staff.
- (g) Discuss targeted community grants to support community activities with the community grants staff.
- (h) Discuss the future process to hear submissions on user fees and charges where Bay Venues Limited fees and charges are included.

CARRIED

15 CLOSING KARAKIA

Commissioner Shad Rolleston gave the closing karakia.

The meeting closed at 2.28 pm.

The minutes of this meeting were confirmed as a true and correct record at the Ordinary Council meeting held on 19 June 2023.

.....
CHAIRPERSON