



MINUTES

**Ordinary Council meeting
Monday, 12 February 2024
Tuesday, 13 February 2024
Wednesday, 14 February 2024**

2024-2034 Long-term Plan Hearings

Order of Business

| | | |
|-----------|--|-----------|
| 1 | Opening karakia | 3 |
| 2 | Apologies | 3 |
| 3 | Public forum | 3 |
| 4 | Acceptance of late items | 3 |
| 5 | Confidential business to be transferred into the open | 3 |
| 6 | Change to the order of business | 3 |
| 7 | Confirmation of minutes | 3 |
| | Nil | |
| 8 | Declaration of conflicts of interest | 4 |
| 9 | Deputations, presentations, petitions | 4 |
| | Nil | |
| 10 | Recommendations from other committees | 4 |
| | Nil | |
| 11 | Business | 4 |
| 11.1 | 2024-2034 Long-term Plan - Hearings..... | 4 |
| 11.1 | 2024-2034 Long-term Plan – Hearings (<i>continued</i>) | 27 |
| 11.1 | 2024-2034 Long-term Plan – Hearings (<i>continued</i>) | 41 |
| 12 | Discussion of late items | 63 |
| 13 | Public excluded session | 63 |
| | Nil | |
| 14 | Closing karakia | 64 |

**MINUTES OF TAURANGA CITY COUNCIL
ORDINARY COUNCIL MEETING HELD ON
MONDAY, 12 FEBRUARY 2024 AT 1.30PM
BAY OF PLENTY REGIONAL COUNCIL CHAMBERS, REGIONAL HOUSE,
1 ELIZABETH STREET, TAURANGA
TUESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2024 AT 1PM,
CLUB MOUNT MAUNGANUI, 45 KARAKA STREET, MOUNT MAUNGANUI
WEDNESDAY, 14 FEBRUARY 2024 AT 9AM,
HURIA MARAE, 1 KAPONGA STREET, JUDEA, TAURANGA**

PRESENT: Commission Chair Anne Tolley (Chairperson), Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston, Commissioner Stephen Selwood, Commissioner Bill Wasley

IN ATTENDANCE: Marty Grenfell (Chief Executive), Paul Davidson (Chief Financial Officer), Barbara Dempsey (General Manager: Community Services), Christine Jones (General Manager: Strategy, Growth & Governance), Alastair McNeill (General Manager: Corporate Services), Gareth Wallis (General Manager: City Development & Partnerships), Josh Logan (Team Leader: Corporate Planning), Ella Quarmby (Corporate Planning Intern), Coral Hair (Manager: Democracy & Governance Services), Shaleen Narayan (Team Leader: Governance Services), Anahera Dinsdale (Governance Advisor), Janie Storey (Governance Advisor)

1 OPENING KARAKIA

The karakia had been given at the Council meeting earlier in the day.

2 APOLOGIES

Nil

3 PUBLIC FORUM

Nil

4 ACCEPTANCE OF LATE ITEMS

Nil

5 CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS TO BE TRANSFERRED INTO THE OPEN

Nil

6 CHANGE TO THE ORDER OF BUSINESS

Nil

7 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

Nil

8 DECLARATION OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Nil

9 DEPUTATIONS, PRESENTATIONS, PETITIONS

Nil

10 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM OTHER COMMITTEES

Nil

11 BUSINESS

11.1 2024-2034 Long-term Plan - Hearings

The following members of the public spoke to their submission to the 2024-2034 Long-term Plan.

A copy of all presentations and documents tabled at the hearing can be viewed on Tauranga City Council's (TCC) website.

(1) Sub ID: 1101 - Jo Wills

Key points

- Asked what the measures of success were for the LTP and the challenges Council were facing.
- Growth was occurring for the sake of growth and GDP seemed to be the only measure.
- There were no social or environmental outcomes noted as measures.
- If the measure was the GDP, the plan would have won as cash was all that measured.
- TCC was facing a number of problems with its transport, housing, mental health, inequity and the like and there was no evidence of looking at those or contributing to measuring them.
- Council could not make an educated decision on what they were achieving.
- There was no overarching lens of the LTP other than growth and items like sustainability were there as an add on.
- Greenstar rating should be done regardless and was nothing to do with the goals or where Council were wanting to head as a city. Everything should have sustainability lens across it.
- Questioned what would improve the lives of people living in poverty, ratepayers living in poverty, not owning a car, connectivity and reducing emission in a way that was game changing rather than doing something less bad.
- Council cannot just tinker around the edges, it needed to change things.

(2) Sub ID: 1065 - Des Heke

Key points

- Noted the importance infrastructure for Māori land and the LTP.
- There were areas of the future urban limits of Kaitemako which had been missed out in the of planning sequence of how Council could address the anticipated growth areas.
- Council's relationship with a number of Kaitemako land blocks some of which were currently rural that needed to go through a plan change in order to be developed.
- The plan change was reduced to the Ohauti south area, and even if it was a private plan change, the need to encourage the peripheral Māori Land as they all share the same level of service of infrastructure requirements and would result in better community outcomes with more structured and integrated planning as was originally intended.

- The Ohauti-Welcome Bay planning study was put on hold but was important to raise issues around current infrastructure.
- There were new government invested projects to look at to develop Māori land and Council supporting staff and what the housing needs would look like.
- The submitter questioned how Council's proposals fitted and integrated into the current infrastructure.
- There was an opportunity for the Kaitemako land situated above the rural/residential land had a resilient and soon to be main water line, which was an opportunity to provide rider mains to service that community. It still unaddressed and still sitting there as a development issue.
- Currently in the LTCCP and in communication with land trust representatives the Otumanga pump station in the Welcome Bay catchment and across Maungatapu and the Waimapu estuary to bottom of Turret Road had upgraded work carried out in the mid 2000's. The Marae whanau thought that the station would have the capacity to service their land.
- Council recently upgraded some asbestos pipe in the area, but the trust land that were current anticipated growth areas had come to feasibility plans with Council as well as the Trusts further up in the rural zone but the Otumanga pump station had fallen off the LTCCP to be upgraded. This means that all of that planning and efforts to address some of the housing needs would be encumbered by the loss of investment by Council into the Otumanga pump station which needed to be upgraded.
- The submitter noted he was an Iwi representative mainly for waste water, but put the submission in on behalf of all of the land trusts, iwi, hapu and community that would benefit. If the Council were upgrading the asbestos pipes why not the pump station also. Requested that the costings to be brought to light as according to those housing needs.
- There were trustees of the three major land blocks – Kaitemako B & C, Kaitemako M2 & N - had an idea of what they want to build and create on their land and want that accommodated in the plan.

(3) Sub ID: 675 - Phillip Brown, Papamoa Residents & Ratepayers Association

Key points

- Concerned at the tsunami evacuation pathways from Papamoa.
- There was evidence of tsunami debris in the Papamoa hills so it was a real threat to residents.
- Considered that anything to help residents evacuate had been put in the too hard basket.
- The latest tsunami maps released in October 2023 indicate that 90% of Papamoa would be under water.
- There were 30,000 people living in the community that was expected to evacuate to the Papamoa hills which was a distance of 3 kms.
- If a tsunami was from the Kermadec Islands it would reach land within an hour.
- There were no plans as to what was to be done in the future, yet a tsunami could happen at any time.
- Council's attitude was irresponsible, how does 30,000 people get to the hills with no pathways directly to them.
- Emergency sirens, as used by other towns had been cancelled. Instead a group had met once and disbanded with no follow up to residents.
- Papamoa roads would be gridlocked and for those travelling by foot or bike, they needed to cross the eastern link. There were only three ways to cross, with the new interchange bridge adding a fourth crossing.
- When asked to put a pedestrian crossing on the interchange bridge, the reply was any easement over private land was up to developer.
- Isn't it one of Council's obligations to look after its residents.

- In relation to a suggestion to close the expressway to allow easy crossing, was told it was not possible, yet it had recently been closed for a cycle race.
- The current state of the sides of Domain Road only had ditches and no footpath.
- Papamoa residents had considered a set of pathways and presented these to Council and NZTA at a cost of \$20M. Nothing had happened since that presentation.
- There was responsibility of care and welfare for residents.
- Commissioners were driving change, this was an opportunity of a lifetime but at Papamoa they want an opportunity for a life.

In response to questions

- Staff were doing a lot of work since the release of the maps in October 2023 and the issues raised were being taken seriously.
- The matter of the closure of the expressway was raised with the NZTA Board last year and it was agreed that it would be done.
- Staff were prepared to work with the Association and this would happen.

(4) Sub ID: 1478 - Garth Mathieson, The Tauranga Millennium Track Trust

Key points

- Track Trust supports option 3 and opposes any form of stadium being included in the LTP.
- The business case provided by Priority One allowed for 15,000 seats, a community multi-sport facility and a university sports science centre. Rotorua already had a 20,000 seat stadium, with half of the population.
- There was no carparking in that area of Tauranga.
- A community stadium cannot be matched and would result in a loss of a substantial part of the greenspace and limited use of the fields.
- It would be built on a recreation reserve and compete with other function centres.
- Community multi-sport facility was a flash name for changing rooms.
- Waikato University had indicated to the submitter that they were not committed to a stadium and the inclusion of them as a proposed tenant may suggest they were tenant, which was beyond any discussions held to date.
- Was there to be a proper account of noise that would come from events held?
- The creation of revenue streams was a fantasy. Did not consider that the grounds would not get 248 events in first year or 5,000 attendees at each game.
- NPS rugby games cost an average of \$400,000 to stage and some do not pay.
- Why have a second regional rugby stadium, when Rotorua was 1 hour away and it was only 15 minutes from Bay Park. It would compete with those facilities.
- The cost of a new stadium was \$250M with a loss of \$15M per year expected.
- There was still \$150M of funding to find.
- Why target philanthropic donors and not other groups.
- How much was BOP Rugby contributing?
- All local organisations should go out and get money and put in an effort themselves if they want a stadium.
- 59% residents were against the proposal so the decisions should be turned around as it was too soon to put it in the LTP and too soon to justify it.

(5) Sub ID: 868 - Barry Scott

Key points

- Opposed to the Tauranga domain proposal.
- Emphasise the contention that Council failed to validly consult about the proposal.
- Local Government Act notes the need to consider the views of the community and encourage people to present those views and make a presentation. Council was to receive these with an open mind and had failed to do that adequately.

- Online survey results revealed that the majority disagreed with the proposal.
- Council designed the survey and only gave submitters five minutes to speak.
- Not enough consultation was held which was a breach of the Act.
- Another major breach was the discussions to be held in an open and transparent manner. In May 2023 a Project Development Committee was appointed to oversee feasibility study with nothing included on any web pages and when asked for more information was advised it was not a formal Council group and was a partnership with Council and Priority One.
- Anne Tolley and the Chief Executive had attended the Governance and Workshop Group meetings but no record of meetings were put on the webpage.
- Looks like people were being deliberately kept away and there was nothing to indicate the partnership existed.
- Council must consider all reasonable options and consider advantages and disadvantages. The Working Group was to consider only the domain for a stadium and other sites only if domain was impossible to use as the site.
- The majority of the group had some interest in proposal going ahead, so was not completely unbiased and it was not unfair to wonder if decisions were made from discussions at those meetings.
- People were suspicious of outcomes and if you try to hide it undermines the credibility and validity of those decisions.
- There was no need to do the work under Priority One, it could have been an in-house exercise which would have been more open and transparent and free from any bias.
- Would like Council to admit to itself and withdraw the project from the LTP, put it back on the shelf and leave it for the new Council to consider in due course.
- Pause the whole process and extend the process of the adoption of the LTP to end of September 2024 so that the elected representatives could have a look at it.
- Excellent submission of the Tauranga Historic Village Board which should also be put on hold until it could be reviewed. The Village was helping residents with mental health issues and was the best. Council should support it and not make it harder.

(6) Sub ID: 1252 - Scott Adams, Carrus

Key points

- Applaud Commissioners for progressing the LTP to be operative by July 2024.
- Two developments progress delayed due to lack to infrastructure.
- Te Tumu was the number one priority growth area in the Western Bay and rezoned in 2002 for future development and Council must find a pathway to proceed.
- Carrus request a change in the LTP to say that the Council and main land owners were progressing the plan change with best case notification target of July 2024 which was before the 10 years expired and before the new Council was elected.
- Te Tumu landowners had a desire and belief that this could be done with the building of houses being commenced in 2030. Need to accelerate the rezoning now and explore funding options with central government.
- 49 Pukemapu Road – after purchasing more than 9 ha of land the developers and having been assured by Council engineers there was infrastructure capacity and entering into a \$3.2M Rowesdale residential share compensation deal of which TCC contributed to and brought 2 houses for road access.
- Carrus spent 12 months carrying out iwi consultation and a lengthy Heritage NZ process to remove an archaeological site from the land.
- Now have grave concerns that the ability to develop the residential zoned land to provide urgently needed housing was ruined because of service network constraints.
- Council engineers had advised that despite the land having been zoned residential for 20 years, there was not sufficient water or wastewater capacity to service the land with 460 new residences.

Amended by Council
resolution CO4/24/1
dated 4 March 2024

Amended by Council resolution CO4/24/1 dated 4 March 2024

- The Rowesdale developers were not tasked by Council at the time of their development to future proof their infrastructure, so why was the land rezoned residential if there was no way to service it.
- Had been advised that 2 of 4 waste water upgrades necessary would be implemented between 2026-28 and the other two as late as 2044, so unless Council engineers collaborate with Carrus construction team to come up with alternative solutions which they had already indicated that they were not willing to do, then either would be no development in Pukemapu for the next 10-20 years.
- Wastewater was already near spillage and the nearest one to service the land was located at Joplin Way, 1.2 k away from the boundary and as developer would be responsible for the cost of the \$7M for construction a new dedicated sewer pipeline and which was not ready for use until 2028.
- Because of wider downstream sewer network system improvements would also be required for the development and some were not included in the draft LTP so would not be available until after 2034.
- Other upgrades to pump stations were not included in the plan.
- Request a follow up meeting with the Commissioners and Chief Executive to explore with Council on site storage and off site peak discharge could be used to ensure that the development could commence including stormwater management, water, firefighting solutions, wastewater treatment and future roading for both blocks.
- Given the cost of \$18M so far, Carrus request Commissioners put pressure on the Council engineers to be more flexible so that Carrus commence with the development. There were other solutions but have no transparency to Council modelling and any collaboration to alternative solutions had so far been rejected.
- The Pukemapu project had been given key account status under the Rowesdale compensation agreement between Carrus and Council so all need realise this. There need to be some serious outside the box thinking to get it underway urgently with interim solutions and overall development solutions so that consents could be lodged for earthwork and roading consents for an October 2024 earthworks start.
- Wants to work with Council towards a robust solution.

Amended by Council resolution CO4/24/1 dated 4 March 2024

In response to questions

- Commissioner Tolley noted that they were not aware of some of the points raised and would follow up with staff.

(7) Sub ID: 812 - Todd Morris, Otumoetai Cadets Cricket Club

Key points

- Proposal of increase fees did the opposite and the more they learned, the worse it got.
- If groups of residents had a proposal, you could get a diverse range of people.
- The existing fields were used for a few hours a week and now Council want to charge for it which was not fair or consistent, but a cash grab.
- The subjective terms were more propaganda than fact.
- Social cohesion and were counter to Council's own dos.
- No impact analysis was done, they just want money for pet projects not more.
- Big money was being spent on skate parks, library and the like with no consistency and fairness as people were not charged for the use of those facilities.
- If Council kill the senior clubs with the proposed charges, the junior clubs would follow.
- The club were already battling to survive.
- Any health and wellbeing benefit comments were absent from the proposal.
- There was a legacy at stake that decision makers would have to live with.
- Already killed off many sports clubs. Council were for destruction not cohesiveness.
- Volunteers work long hours to maintain community groups.
- Some kids and grandkids committed suicide and Council were pouring petrol on that.
- The charges would kill sports clubs with no analysis being done.

- Show decency and goodwill and put the proposal in the dustbin where it belongs.
- The players came from a lot of different backgrounds and make connections on the field. There were lawyers and doctors playing alongside beneficiaries.
- While the submitter knows that Council want the city to survive but wanted them to prove it.

(8) Sub ID: 1546 - Keni Piahana, Kelly Waaka

Key points

- The notion of industrial rate was sensible, with Tauranga a centre for the country in many ways, and while there were reservations at first on the cost of living but with the port activities, it looked like they paid attention to the services as well.
- Shortfall of 50% for Pyes Pa was seen as a catch up mode from the 1990's with the inception of the plan and greenfield subdivisions which saw so much happened so quickly with the cost implications manifesting later on.
- If people could see the actual cost and what was involved in infrastructure they would understand it more.
- Selling of the car park buildings as a way to fund community projects, but raised questions at Waimapu Marae as to what community projects the proceeds were funding when they do not have footpaths or street lighting.
- Since the Commissioner's had attended a hui at the Marae they had gained so much more with staff commitment to the projects raised.
- In 1860 the hapu withdrew and moved from Huria back into the Waimapu. From then until now they had been in a position of withdrawal as that gave them control. However over time although they had lost control with new roads and pipes, they still had the view that it was still a good move for them as the Waimapu Pa Road area was home and of significance to them.
- Now in 2024, there were all those things that they were going without and now want to put pressure on as there were no footpaths for the children to walk to school and the street lighting was poor.
- An application had been made to have been considered previously and staff had engaged with the Waimapu community well.
- Request Council to look at road speed limits and the support 30km for the whole stretch of road right out Poike Road intersection as people had to walk on the narrow stretch of road.
- Support SmartTrip proposal which the considered could be taken a lot further as making a modal shift would make a difference to the congestion being seen at present.
- An LTP performance measure for the iwi was that a child should be able to leave home with their parents knowing they were safe as a common place like it used to be and having children restoring their own independence to go to school on their own.
- Need good linkages, connectivity and public transport options as some families were running 2-3 cars as the options for alternative public transport were not strong.

In response to questions

- Submitter was thanked and advised that a check would be made with staff and an update provided.

(9) Sub ID: 1663 - Lorin Waetford, Ngai Tukairangi Ahu Whenua Trust

Key points

- Trust not supportive on any of the consultative questions and want to be more informed around the issues.
- Request \$150,000 be set aside for the Ngai Tukairangi Ahu Whenua Trust to update their Hapu Management Plans to make sure they were updated and sat above and fed into Council plans.

- Too often hapu representatives provide time, effort and work for the whole city before their own communities.
- Hapu representations were ignored by staff or only had a tangata whenua or mana whenua chapter layer added in to details at a later time with no specified date.
- Presented a submission to the SmartGrowth strategy and pointed out the failure of Council to include Māori Land Trusts in the planning process, or detailing who they were and what value they could have in it.
- For the whole city - if tangata whenua were striving - all would. This does not mean the replacement of hapu and iwi land trusts as they all had a part to play.
- The LTP consultation process did not target any iwi consultation. Māori being able to come to any of the community engagement events was not an inclusive process.
- There was not enough time to show the issues that come from the top down and to bring kaupapa to Māori communities.
- Engage with the wider whanau was needed to ascertain if they were aware of the LTP and if it had capacity for more than one member.
- Lack of safety with some of the roads, noting the recent death of a child and offering tai toko that the child was taken before Council were doing anything. This was not the first time that Council had acted only after a death had occurred.
- Council could expect a letter of opposition to the SmartTrip proposal as the Trust had tenants in Grey Street properties.
- The life span of the Commissioners was coming to an end and they were trying to get the LTP over the line. The Trusts were here way before and would be long after the Councillors were elected in.

In response to questions

- Noted that discussions had been held with Rangapu regarding the plan and that they had also made a submission.
- Point taken regarding the Land Trusts.

(10) Sub ID: 1578 - Annie Hill, Creative BOP

Key points

- Thanks for the community arts and culture that was occurring and understanding the value of it to the city.
- The group enhanced the health, wellbeing, educational outcomes of residents while stimulating innovation and economic growth.
- Had developed a strong track record of delivering programmes to the art sector with positive changes.
- Deep connections had been developed in the creative sector which had positioned them well to add significant value to Council.
- Well placed to help Council and maximise opportunities as they arose.
- Exciting opportunities to support an arts, culture heritage investment plan.
- Support for iwi and hapu to reach their aspirations.
- Support for Māori and non-Māori to access resources and contribute to the public art framework with historical and cultural narratives,
- Development of a strong sector in advocating for the arts as member of Arts Aotearoa, developing strategic relationships and engaging with the sector in arts culture and creativity.
- Happy to talk more and were to open to opportunities to extend their contract with the Council.

(11) Sub ID: 1077 - Michel Galloway, Tauranga Lawn Tennis Club**Key points**

- Concerned at the increased rent charges for clubs using Council sports grounds with the new user pay fees as recovery fees.
- Object to the stadium proposal.
- Users pay for small clubs shows a disconnect to them.
- No consultation had been done before putting these items into the LTP.
- 100% recovery would provide a rent to increase from \$800 to \$37,000 plus gst which was untenable and creating a lot of stress on small clubs which would likely result in closure.
- Most clubs were located in residential areas and contributed much to the wellbeing of their community by providing programmes with juniors and working with school children through to the older residents for no revenue.
- There were no foreseeable grounds for cost recovery unless the Council want to pay for some of the sports development programmes from development levies otherwise there would be a loss of membership and loss of clubs.
- Why should the clubs be penalised when they did not have the funds to pay.
- Using the LTP to float the increase was unfortunate, as there had been little input from users.
- People value greenspaces but building a stadium would reduce the free use of an area which had been used for generations. It would also lead to a loss of some of the community sports currently operating on the domain.
- A stadium would be costly to build and to operate.
- The majority of those surveyed strongly opposed the building and paying for it.
- Remove the stadium from the LTP and use the funding for other community facilities.

(12) Sub ID: 1492 - Peter McKinlay**Key points**

- Submission based on 30 years working within extensively with local government and advisers around the globe.
- The fees and charges policy and the Council decision making process was non-compliant with the provisions of the Local Government Act as it failed to address the purpose of the promotion of local democratic decision making by and on behalf of communities and the promotion of the four well beings and does not recognise that the role of local government was furthering the purpose of local government in the district
- There was nothing to indicate that Council had any understanding of those requirements or of Section 14 of the Act where it must consider the impact of each of the four well beings.
- Similar to UK recently where as part of a general competence provision, Councils were required to further community wellbeing. When judicial review proceedings were undertaken many were overturned. This was the view the courts would take was that the Act provided very clear requirements. Most Councils in NZ do not observe them, and a practice grown up in the sector over the years. This explains it but does not excuse the non-compliance.
- The submitter does not expect the Commissioners would have to go back and redo the decision, the main purpose for the submission was to raise understanding with the public that the Council had consistently not complied with the requirements of the Act and to alert the incoming Councillors that there was a serious and endemic problem of non-compliance that they would need to deal with.
- There were not individuals that should be blamed for this as it was an endemic problem in the sector in large part because of the way central government had treated local government which explains but does not excuse.

- Then only course open to Council if it wished to be compliant was to go back and understand the requirements of the Act and apply them in future decision making. This would require significant change in the way the Council does its business but observing the law should not be seen as an unduly onerous obligation.

In response to questions

- In response to a query as to a sense of the nature of scope of change the submitter believed necessary, he noted that in developing any policy Council explicitly needed to consider and promote in the district of what impact it had by and on other communities and what impact was being had on the four well beings. Section 14 of the Act considers the impact of each of the four well beings on each decision. It was more than showing it in a document it was adopting it and implementing it as per the requirements of the legislation.

(13) Sub ID: 1362 - Kathryn Lellman, Nicky Hansen, Tauranga Arts Festival Trust

Key points

- Remind communities of the importance of arts and culture to the city and its residents.
- Significant debate had been held in the United Kingdom where arts were seen as the cherry on cake, when actually the arts were the cake.
- Support for Spaces and Places to connect, play and learn with the revitalisation and bringing the heart of the city alive.
- The Arts Festival in October and November 2023 had 52 ticketed events and 7 free events which attracted over 10,000 people and school children with artwork from a variety of artists from tangata whenua, Pasifika, North and South Asia and LGBTQIA. .
- Over 30% were first time attendees, with most being very satisfied.
- The attendees and visitors made the city a better place.
- The arts were strongly contributing and creating exciting things to do for all ages and abilities
- The investment of the museum, library, theatre and outdoor spaces, what happens there was justified. 452
- Still have to justify the cost of the use of buildings such as Baycourt and the Cargo shed
- Acknowledge Council support for the use of the Crystal Palace free of charge.
- The cost for the use of other spaces needed to be cost realistic and affordable as the arts were for the benefit of the community and an investment in our future .
- Acknowledge and appreciate the support given by Council during 2023.
- Seek to ensure a balanced investment in the arts and not just putting cherry on top. Continue to invest in the events still to come.

In response to questions

- Commissioners acknowledged the Arts Festival as a great event.

(14) Sub ID: 1237 - Warren Banks

Key points

- 41 years as a resident and life member of Priority One and a CCO member.
- Spending priorities of the Council were wrong as there was nothing to bring businesses back into town.
- Cameron Road pipe works became so much more and resulted in a loss to all as it restricted traffic flow.
- The proposal to implement a congestion charge when Council had reduced parking in the town and had made attendance harder to get to the Bay Oval.
- More congestion had occurred with the on road cycleways as they were unsafe and creating barriers to gain access to business premises. People were looking for the premises not the cyclists.

- Cost escalation was being put on sports and community clubs, causing widespread damage to the health of all ages across the community as they could not afford the increased fees. Should Council deprive parts of community with these increased costs.
- Community gardens were a cost.
- The Mens Shed had an amended leases for more than one tenant.
- The increased cost for the Historic Village was unjustified. The Village was a healthy and active community and any closure threatened all ages.
- Alfresco dining would also be affected.
- Public transport system was flawed as there was an abundant provision for bus lanes which only caused a congestion of the traffic flow.
- Use smaller buses as the bigger ones were mostly empty.
- Motorcycle access around the city was great.
- If Council needed new revenue source for the nice to have projects then cut costs. The focus should be on essentials not beauty programmes.
- The community deserved to see dollars and dates for the projects.
- Keep up the recycling and the track developments on Mt Maunganui.
- While there had been a dysfunctional Council before, it was now a misaligned one.
- Keep the people informed.

(15) Sub ID: 1008 - Arun Baby

Key points

- Proposed ground usage charges were from a concerned player and parent perspective who was apprehensive of the increases being imposed.
- The financial implication of the increases affected families and the broader cricket community, especially the junior players.
- There was a cost increase of 421% in competition fees for senior players from \$221 to \$3,400 per team..
- Families with multiple players would have double or triple the subscription cost.
- While respecting the plans, the reality was that all senior and junior competitions would have the same cost which would make it harder for them to transition from junior grade to the seniors.
- Junior programmes relied on the dedication of senior players as coaches, managers, mentors and role models. The loss of those senior players would affect the junior programmes and have an impact on their cricketing skills..
- Accessibility – there would be financial barriers for senior players to remain in the club and to embark on roles for the benefit of all players.
- Youth and junior groups would be adversely affected as the fee increase would impact on those players as they like to see their seniors actively playing the sport.
- Appeal for the consideration of cricket in the community and to have a commitment towards retaining the senior players as Council risk disputing the delicate balance of the cricketing community.

(16) Sub ID: 1653 - Evan Turbot, Tauranga Village Radio

Key points

- The Radio station had been situated at the Historic Village for 40 years and was part of the cultural identity of the village and the city.
- There were serious safety issues with the building and were working with management to resolve those issues.
- The Village was established in the 1970's as a permanent space to work with the community.
- People were invited to use spaces for little or no cost and the Village radio station responded to that call.

- While visions could change, the people of Tauranga had not changed.
- Want the Council to hear that the Village was a place for ratepayer investment.
- Revenue gained from users pays and a return on assets would bring distress to the many volunteers who run not for profit services at the Village. 75% of the tenants were community organisations.
- From a city wide average, the rent looked reasonable, but only if you were a commercial entity not a local authority. It was too high, even with a discount for community groups.
- Questioned whether consideration had been given to the Local Government Act in regard to the four well beings as there was no word of social and cultural wellbeing in the revenue gathering statement.
- Was Council discharging its obligations as it applied these charges to the groups in the Historic Village.

In response to questions

- In response to a query regarding income it was noted that the station had limited resources, with the only real income coming from charitable grant funders. A subscription of \$5 a year was paid by some supporters of the Village radio and they had \$30,000 in the bank.
- The group had serious financial constraints in the past and they were once again scared that they would be facing them again in the future.

(17) Sub ID: 294 - Jaijus Pallipadan, Johny

Key points

- Lived in Tauranga for three years and was a member of a cricket club playing senior cricket.
- The fees expected from users was unfair and it was crucial to recognise these were non-profit community organisations.
- There were a lot of health and wellbeing benefits relating to sporting activities.
- The players relied on affordable or free access as they operated on minor budgets, many of whom were volunteers. It was tough to get sponsors this year.
- The financial strain being caused would reduce or cease the cricket programmes.
- Many non-profit organisations assist backward or under privileged groups and provided valuable opportunities for these groups while also giving them the ability to fulfil their missions to help their community.
- The increase in fees undermines equal opportunities for social, health and recreation.
- Request the decision makers to give further consideration for the non-profit user fees for sports fields, uphold fairness and demonstrate commitment in building a healthier and more vibrant community for all.

In response to questions

- Commissioner Tolley thanked the submitter and noted the dilemma Council was facing with sports users for indoor facilities paying more than those using the outdoor sports fields and asked how did Council get that balance right so all users get a fair go. Many of those users were also on fixed incomes and were managing to keep their facilities up to scratch.
- Council also needed to look at filling in the gaps with sporting facilities over the next 10 years, which was not an easy outcome.

At 3.07pm the meeting adjourned.

At 3.30pm the meeting reconvened.

(18) Sub ID: 1495 – Heidi Lichtwart, Larissa Cuff, Nick Chambers Sport Bay of Plenty**Key points**

- Sport Bay of Plenty appreciated the gravity of the situation with a growing city.
- Sport was a key to healthier and more connected communities which was shown in the submissions received.

In response to questions

- Commissioner noted that they value of the relationship with Sport Bay of Plenty.
- Noted that when Bay Venues Limited set their fees and charges they were higher for indoor sport creating a huge disparity in sporting costs which was a big issue.
- Art and environmental groups also wanted same amount of funding.
- Commissioners understood the value of all sport, play and active recreation, along with the health and connected community benefits.
- Mr Chambers noted at a recent indoor sport users forum that there was a balancing act with the challenges of the city and active recreation and sport. Collaborative partnerships together with outdoor sports users, Council and ratepayers facing it together and understanding the reasons and looking at how to remain solution focused without participation dropping off.
- Ensure engagement was held with clubs around the fees being staged and more feasible to ensure increased participation not a reduction.
- Other Councils had also gone through similar processes.

(19) Sub ID: 851 - Ken Green**Key points**

- The comments on assumptions that most tend to make about stadiums were from the people who want them.
- Lots of research had been carried out from sports economists around the world.
- Criticism of the four assumptions in the report.
- The cost were always wrong resulting in cost blow outs by saying we also need this and that, or it would be so much better with a roof.
- While the projects all start out as multi-use, they never were, and as soon as the grass was put in that made it a rugby stadium for the local franchise or players. These groups were only a small part of the population.
- Usually 90% of the facility was empty and stadiums always looked inward not outward to the community and did nothing.
- A stadium was not a good use of ratepayers money.
- The cost to run these edifices were high. A really good CEO and marketing team was needed as there were always promises made of how much they make, but they hardly ever did and did not even make money to cover capital costs.
- The benefits to the community were always exaggerated, over stated and utter nonsense. The prediction of 100% occupancy in hotels was a farce when there was generally an 80% occupancy anyway.
- Council was always on about how much was spent at games, but \$100 spent by a family on a rugby match was spent and they would not be able to spend it anywhere else.
- If Council spend \$300M it would be a lost opportunity to do something else. With all of the infrastructure problems money had to be spent for a far better purpose.
- Put the plans for a stadium on the shelf until Council feel the city was wealthy or for someone with all the dough comes up.

(20) Sub ID: 1494 - Katie Mayes, NZTA - Waka Kotahi**Key points**

- Reiterate NZTA support for Tauranga City Council and SmartGrowth for road pricing.
- Important to make the most of transport infrastructure that the city had and manage the demand.
- Pricing and other economic tools were important to manage the demand.
- Tauranga city had traffic issues and NZTA give support for exploring road pricing schemes. The Minister of Transport noted recently in the coalition agreement that the government wanted to get on with road pricing quickly as it was an effective way to manage demand and other utility services.
- NZTA could see benefit to keep exploring and to support the quality of life for residents and trades people to be able to move around the city, using a bus or their own transport as their choice.
- Keen to keep working with Council and national elements around the country and noted the specific issues being faced around Tauranga.

In response to questions

- Commissioner Tolley noted that a bad job had been done explaining SmartGrowth to the people.
- There were a number of good issues coming through the submissions noting that whatever the government does it needed to take into account that some people had no supermarket locally or had to drop their children off to school as there was no bus for them. Council would collate the issues raised in the submissions for the government to consider and take into account when the legislation was being designed, as addressing these would make it work or not work and make fair or not fair.
- Ms Mayes noted that it was good to be collating the issues for consideration at a national level and to see what those were. Pricing was part of a package of how to manage traffic and people moving around a city. There needed to be choices so public transport needed to be looked at to see if there was sufficient frequency and range to give people a choice.
- Funding and financing of transport was broken and widely acknowledged with NZTA telling the Ministry to make sure to keep the purpose closely aligned with what they were trying to achieve and to raise revenue to manage the demand.
- There was a need to return to the fundamentals to fully user pays principal and take into account equity issues at a national scale and local considerations to add on. It should be demand management rather than revenue raising as many Councils had high debt levels and infrastructure services so something had to give at a national and local level.

(21) Sub ID: 1496 - Lee Siegle, Sustainability Options**Key points**

- Working in the Bay of Plenty for 11 years on a range of different projects within the sustainability space, and in a social capacity they were presently working in the housing space.
- Make housing huge priority as the city did not have enough and with what they did have, some was not in a great condition and needed remediation work.
- The group go into homes and teach residents how to run their home more efficiently with items such as glass ventilation, drapes and the like.
- Economic impact notes that poor housing had a negative health impact on many families and costs the country at least \$1B a year. This also adds to the cost of lost work with sick kids needing to be looked after.
- Following advice and tips to homeowners, some of the children were now at school every day so the parents were able to work.

- Environmental impact of housing with old homes being drafty and losing heat was an energy waste and if a house did not operate properly it would become full of mould which was not good for health.
- If any person wanted advice or assistance, they were there to share education and help to make Tauranga a thriving city.

In response to questions

- In response to a query it was noted that the group were not working with Councils urban design panel.
- There had not been any indication from Kainga Ora for funding assistance or whether they were interested in expanding their funding to allow sustainability options. The programme was open to all residents to benefit.
- Commissioners noted the great work being undertaken by Sustainable Options.

(22) Sub ID: 825 - Mark Dean and Lyall Holmes, Rotary Centennial Trust

Key points

- Could see potential with the enlivenment of the city centre and asked the Council to get on with it.
- Noted a river water pool seen in Brisbane which included sand and beaches, which would be a winner for here. It could be located between the Harbourside Restaurant and The Strand with the walkway and underpass in place this could be the next stage. Request that a water pool be added to the LTP to be investigated.
- Grandchildren swim at the harbourside steps, but it was difficult because of the tide. A salt water pool would be used all the time and draw people into the city and would not replace the use of the aquatic centre.
- It was secluded and safe to swim at the Mount and was popular with families and young children.
- The harbourside area was good for dining until you get rowdy hoons driving through. Suggested the use of barrier arms from 6 pm to 6 am and let cafes put tables on the street that was free of traffic to create an eating precinct second to none and a delightful place to dine.
- Retailers were experiencing a down turn at present. Suggest a full blown street market once month as it would not cost much to put on.
- Kopurererua Valley development off the State Highway and Takitimu Drive extension where 350 ha of farmland was restored by the Rotary Centennial Trust to a wetland was a unique area and had the potential to be a wetland reserve in the city where people could connect with the environment.
- The Rotary Centennial Trust was set up to raise money to augment the Council budget and was not being used. There was a lot of money available from TECT, Lotteries Commission and the like that was not being sought.
- The Trust had already put in a lot of plants and infrastructure like bridges and it was considered that Council should use the Trust to provide the funds to develop the area further.
- It was a huge space for nature and an opportunity to encourage people to take nature into their own gardens and get behind it like the Western Bay District Council had done in Katikati and Te Puke.

In response to questions

- In response to a query Mr Holmes, Chair of Rotary Centennial Trust noted that no communication had taken place between the Trust, Council and iwi and noted that they would like to start a conversation as all three organisations were essential to make it all work.
- It was important how, as a city, we could maximise benefit of the Rotary Trust who also had the resources to raise funds as necessary from groups that were not currently being used.

(23) Sub ID: 1564 – Catherine Stewart, Simone Anderson, Phil Hayho, Incubator Creative Hub (and supporters)**Key points**

- Noted in the room were a number of community people in support of the submission.
- Council needed to understand what had gone on with the Historic Village and the hard work of volunteers, businesses and people who could not afford the rent hike proposed.
- Incubator was involved with the strategy and communication process for the Village.
- Urge Commissioners to speak with the people, the Village was the heartbeat of the community and if the Council ramped up the rents it would kill off many good community and not for profit organisations.
- The group acknowledged the work of the Commissioners and appreciate the work that had been done.
- Seek engagement in a mutual vision for an arts and culture community in Tauranga and region to add value for the city and have the LTP create decisions so that the creative community could thrive.
- The Village had created jobs and was attracting visitors and pathways to a sustainable community and creative fabric of the city.
- Noted the purpose of the four community well beings within the environment of all parts of the Village and the viability with the hub which had been tested and holds true.
- Overwhelmed by the community support through the submission process with 15% submissions supporting the Village and 25% on the proposed increase in the fees and charges.
- The submissions were diverse to make creative arts available to all from grass roots up.
- Tabled a request to open dialogue around the submission for a trusted partnership with the Commissioners and Council Chief Executive .
- Marty noted he was a Trustee of the Incubator and a psychiatrist who had worked globally and in some significantly impoverished war torn areas where he had learned a lot about mental health and social cohesion.
- There were significant mental health and social cohesion issues in the city with people battling substance use, homelessness, mental illness, social issues, youth and engagement with youth more challenging, elderly growing population. The arts was an industry which was what incubator was and exactly the work a community should be doing.
- Arts was an area for people to come together, to discuss things and have a relationship. It provided a median to engage and create something and develop themselves, more so than a lot of other strategies.
- Management team had several hundred people coming in for the vision, most of whom were unpaid They acted financially responsibly and within financially wise strategies to do as much as they could within the resources available.
- There was a lot of anxiety and stress in organisations with people leaving because of the ongoing tension.
- Would appreciate and benefit from it if there was greater stability and understanding around the funding and a greater degree of longer term commitment to allow them to do better with the planning and to form a greater partnership and engagement with the city.
- Council had been excellent with funding, but there was always more needed and more would be appreciated.
- Simone was an advocate for arts and creativity and was overwhelmed with the 318 submitters who had put forward their views, 12 of which were speaking at the meeting.
- All of the submitters were everyday people and while she acknowledges change never suits all, investing in the future was necessary and to embrace the appetite for change and foster creativity in infinity.
- Overcome hurdles. The strategy highlights the city vision “Together we can”. Change requires commitment drawn on years of this to breathe life in this Village where

everyone was valued. Now with the proposed increased charges to recover capex and opex costs it was unrealistic and puts the vibrant city at risk.

- The costs were not sympathetic to the value of the work in the Village, as it was a flourishing community hub with a variety of accessible services for the community. But those restrictions would make it hard to deliver.
- Everyone was in the same boat working for the same challenges and through partnership and creative thinking we could do it together.
- It was a situation of not only what Council could get from us but what they could do together to get a momentum of results.
- There had been a lot of fundraising and hours of volunteer time put into the Village which provides a strong and flexible core for community art programmes.
- Want to engage in discussions around the growth of the language of arts and creativity.
- Thank you for the opportunity and look forward to an outcome of forward thinking leadership. Without Art was the same as without mauri and wairua.

(24) Incubator Sub ID: 305 - Jill Leyton, Robin and Anne Wikingi

Key points

- The group were known as the Jack Duster Ukulele Players and wanted to express enormous gratitude to Incubator.
- They were originally a group of 7 and were now up to 40, mostly of the older age group.
- There was a huge need for older age group people to get together and have common interests.
- The group were invited to play at the Village and had ongoing relationships.
- People in the group now had the confidence to play in public.
- They also had members suffering from dementia and special needs joining.
- Other community groups were now asking the group to play, with any money earned going back into the community.
- The group sung a Waiata of unity and togetherness.

(25) Incubator Sub ID: 063 - Hayley Smith, Okorore Nga toi Māori

Key points

- The art group and heritage building was gifted to the Incubator and iwi took great pride that the whare tupuna had given the whare house to the Incubator so that their Tipuna could use it.
- All involved were paying residents and artists that fund the Village and all were involved with creativity, delivery of volunteer hours and service to the community.
- 180 years to celebrate Okorore Māori gallery was stemmed from loins of iwi – so began the infrastructure of the Tauranga Moana, hapu and iwi fabric of society of the Historic Village.
- The history of the whare was deeply engraved within iwi who continue to set pathways for their toi and fabric of many kaupapa to the community, volunteer hours and services that they pay to fund and to deliver.
- \$7,000 was being paid for water which they do not have in their space, so were struggling to understand how capex and opex cost could be dropped on the group as servants to their forefathers. This could not equate to the volunteer hours and trying to make Okorore a destination as it was a gallery in one of the oldest homesteads of the area.
- Council must allow them to hold the space for the delivery whakapapa and genealogy of the people where it started 180 years ago and still had many years to come.
- Their people had been here before and it shows.

(26) Incubator Sub ID: 063 and Sub ID 311 - Carla Acacio**Key points**

- A tattoo artist originally from Brazil who had come to live in this beautiful town, but had noticed that under surface something vital missing.
- Listened to many stories regarding mental health and addictions within a few months of arriving here. Brazil had more.
- Tauranga needs more spaces where people can use expression and get the feel of truly being connected. The Village was a multi culturalism space with a vibrancy because it was real.
- There were no fancy flash buildings, what was there comes from local artists and the only place to find this was at the Historic Village and the Incubator where people could enjoy belonging and where everything was truly alive and valuable.
- Hopes that the Council understands that the Incubator was the heart and soul of the town and should be protected.

(27) Incubator Sub ID: 054- Sam Allen**Key points**

- Sam quoted a poem that he had written which was created with art in his heart and paint in veins, all he saw was vultures and a home without culture and a of lack of artistry in the Bay.
- If funds were taken away from the community what was humanity without artistry.

(28) Incubator Sub ID: 176 - Tina Zhang, NZ China Friendship Association**Key points**

- President of the local NZ China Friendship Association.
- The Village was not just a place that Chinese could share a culture and arts centre, but to build a home for the Chinese community and cultural exchange.
- It was not a typical commercial hub, it was a place where culture could flourish, where they could celebrate heritage, share stories and friendship in the spirit of bringing people together.
- The group love their new home.

(29) Incubator Sub ID: 130- Sequoia Trass and MaryAnne**Key points**

- Sequoia was a 16 year old student from Otumoetai College who had been going to the Village for 10 years as her mother was a worker at the Incubator. She noted that she could not have spent that 10 years any better and would continue to spend much time there.
- She learnt a number of skills, including using watercolour, sewing, ceramic lessons and was open to so much more with the hundreds of diverse music gigs.
- Mary Ann was 8 years old and does a number of different classes and learns a lot of different skills and had spent many hours doing sewing classes.
- The Incubator also gets kids involved with scavenger hunts and movies.
- The students had met many other similar people who also go as the focus was on everyday artists not just the elite.
- The inaccessibly to get out and do something was being overrun by greed.
- After many years being connected to the Village and its resident artists you could see what it does for Tauranga, providing a collaborative environment, which would not be able to happen any more if the fees were raised.
- We want to see it flourish through art, culture and the like. The Historic Village was about making a dream for a home in the city a reality.

- Maryanne gave a gift of a soft toy tiki she had made from old blankets to each of the Commissioners.

(30) Incubator Sub ID: 300 – Cherie Anderson, Northern Health School

Key points

- Cherie Anderson worked with numerable groups of youth providing opportunities that they could not access for various reasons including health.
- They were a state school providing educational access to students for kids not able to attend school full time, many of which had severe mental and physical needs.
- While the focus needs to be numeracy and literacy, if it were not for the Incubator, they would not have any creativity in their lives. This was how they expressed themselves.
- The Village was taking vulnerable students and giving them some mana and self-belief through the centre and were about to embark on a 20 week art collaboration course to develop series of Pou Whenua for the front of the school. This would be a life changing experience for some of the students.
- A recent example of a 14 year old who would not leave home started to work in the community garden and now leaves home several times a week to water the gardens as it had given him a real sense of belonging.
- Who would provide this if not the Incubator to establishments such as schools if they had to pay market charges.
- The Incubator cannot afford to pay full rental and the students and future of Tauranga would miss out on the social capital gains which far outstrip any financial gain from increasing the rents, which was short sighted. Anō me he whare pūngawerewere – behold, it is like the web of a spider. If whakatauki was a full stretch of the web it would be reaching out to the full city.

(31) Incubator Sub ID: 069 – David Henderson, Otumoetai College

Key points

- David Henderson, Art teacher at Otumoetai College supported the web metaphor.
- The Incubator was a creative hub giving students a spotlight and exhibiting their art which gave the students a buzz and an opportunity to sell their work. The smiles from the families when they see the work displayed was priceless.
- The Village provides a futures pathway through workshops and art pathways and does not know what they would do without it.

(32) Incubator Sub ID: 017 – Sue MacDougall

Key points

- Submitted noted she was a passionate person and local artist with a window at the gallery.
- 18 months ago and witnessed the impact on the community with the artist window and 46 talented artists providing a platform for them to shine.
- It was a path to accessibility that was open 7 days a week and everyday people were able to indulge in their passion.
- Where else could you find such a dedicated and accessible gallery that gave people the ability to maintain the level of dedication of artists who volunteer their time to ensure it was open to the public.
- Believes in the power of art to enrich lives.
- In reality was Tauranga lacking adequate representation as there were very few options to engage with the community like the Village does.
- The new status art window had begun to make waves for locals and visitors from afar where they could express positively with the purchase of art.

- Cruise ship passengers visit and purchase art which spreads the word here and overseas. We won't have that soon and the increase of fees was leaving the future in the balance if not subsidised 95%.
- The vibrant support may not be available if the rent increases and the artists would be left without a central hub of art.
- Urge to stand with solidarity and rally support for the preservation of art and encourage a vibrant and sensible art centre for generations to come.
- Walk the talk – Tauranga together we can as a city vision.

(33) Incubator Sub ID: 289 – Derek Jacombs

Key points

- Was a jobbing musician who had been touring NZ since 1983 who realises the value of art to a community.
- Some people believe we should all pay for self and others see the richness of a community quantifiable other than money.
- The work of the Incubator Jam Factory was valuable for practitioners and audiences and was a musical wasteland as a place to play. It was a glaring reason when potential audiences were much smaller than expected.
- There was a large elderly population in the facilities many of whom had minimal community engagement and helped 18-25 year olds who were lost to education elsewhere.
- The closure would lead to a shortage of venues with Baycourt and Totara St being expensive and others not suitable for a lot of music that they put on.
- Many artists were excluded from the touring circuit and had to travel elsewhere to interact with other musicians. The Jam Factory had changed that and they now had an influx of folk musicians who did not used to come here but do now.
- It allows ticket prices to be made viable and for other acts to come and had added vibrancy in many ways.
- It helps the youth scene with a host of shows and was a band hire venue for those who do not have a following and provided a real opportunity for them to learn.
- It was also a place where you could work with professionals and learn from jam factory volunteers and to invite bands from other areas. They now get invited to play in other areas.
- The Village should be viewed as an investment in the culture of the town within every tendrill of growth. Don't tinker with it as it was making Tauranga a better place.

(34) Incubator Sub ID: 284 – Kirsty Clegg

Key points

- Submitter was a Health professional who works at Tauranga hospital.
- The Village provides a place where all staff, patients and families could go to have time out.
- After 30 years of working in the health sector, you know that all people need a supportive community connectivity and creativity to feel well and connected. The Incubator gives that in biggies and in bucketloads.
- Ask that Council continue to support a place where people could go to connect, feel safe and access for all people to create their own creativity or help others and was central to the human experience.
- Art makes for better, healthier life choices and this had been proved by research.
- Tauranga was facing terrible health challenges, yet this wonderful and unique place was here to allow them to be happier humans.
- Why would Council want to dismantle this when it held so much of what was needed in one place. It should support the amazing work and continue to support the Incubator for their happiness and health.

- Support creativity not cuts.

(35) Incubator Sub ID: 025 – Sandy Kerr – The Pothouse Collective

Key points

- Part of the potter's collective who were more happy mucking with mud than being at this meeting.
- Had provided a full submission but wanted to provide a visual face to face and stand with the wider Incubator community and the life blood of the power house.
- Newbies would lose the opportunity to stand next to and on the shoulders of nationally recognised potters.
- Any closure would be bad for the whole of the art community and would be multiplied if they were not at the hub. It would not just be ripples, it would be a tidal wave of loss for the community.

Discussion point raised

- Commissioner Tolley noted to the group of submitters that the description of the wellbeing of arts and culture was standing up and roaring and that some others think it was a nice to have.
- What had been shown to Commissioners today was that actually local government was about people and communities and that it was a task to have to balance the budget. They were hearing loudly that the core of any community was its people.

(36) Sub ID: 787 - Vanessa Ham, S Volsky and Jo Bond Font Tauranga Public Art Trust

Key points

- Thanks to the Council on behalf of Font and for receiving an early contribution and to provide the delivery of the first public art sculpture in Red Square.
- Artist Piako Walton was working on the details and these would be revealed in due course.
- Council staff had been great to work with.
- Font were looking forward to the delivery of public art in Tauranga as this was a key for Font.

In response to questions

- The public art was to have been delivered in May but had been pushed back to June due to co-ordination issues with a lot happening in May. It would be in place before the Commissioners leaving.
- Four curatorial advisors had reduced a number of proposals to 4 works and they had gone with Piako. The proposal had all come with manufacturers specifications.
- Public art was a journey which had been included in their 10 year plan, they had not got to the specificity of actual sites or funders at this stage.
- There had been a lot of expressions of interest and approaches made to private funders towards a public art framework. They were working closely with Council staff and mana whenua on the framework.
- Bw engagement with urban design panel – helps all to be anchored
- In relation to engagement with the urban design panel, it was noted that they could not speak to that artwork, but would follow up on that.
- The group were thanked for all the do with regards to public art around the city.

(37) Sub ID: 150 - Nathan Wansbrough – online

Key points

- The submitter had been a quantity surveyor in commercial construction around the Bay of Plenty and Tauranga for over a decade.

- The built environment was important and a passion.
- Focus was on two areas of the LTP which were fantastic and wanted to see implemented - the issue of the sale of the carparks to fund Te Manawataki o Te Papa project and congestion charges and time spent by commuters in the main throughfare.
- Sale of carparks allows more competition with carparks and congestion to act as a disincentive to driving as it becomes harder to get around the city.
- Disincentivising the use of vehicles when there was no suitable alternative as the public transport system was not viable.
- There was a need to come from a different perspective and look at public transport and how to move them to a bus system, to invest more in that and in commuter rail.
- Spoke to the transport panel and they did not want commuter rail in 50 year plan, which was a shame when the corridor was conducive to having it.
- Property developers intensifying the CBD and grants to go towards affordable housing projects would be in play with the public transport and for people to be able to walk and cycle.

In response to questions

- Commissioner Tolley noted that Waka Kotahi want to continue to have discussions and may disincentivise the wrong people. Talked the Bay of Plenty Regional Council and were sharing submissions on public transport services in Tauranga and getting a good feel of the public thinking and lack of transport options.

(38) Sub ID: 1505 and 1506-Jeff Fletcher, Malcolm Short, Geoff Ford, Tumu Kaituna 14 Trust and Ford Land Holdings and Scott Adams, Carrus – on line

Commissioner Walmsley noted that he was a member of the SmartGrowth panel.

Key points

- Included Malcolm Short, Chair of Tumu Kaituna 14 Trust, Geoff Ford Chair of Ford Land Holdings and Scott Adams of Carrus.
- Opportunity for the Te Tumu urban area as it was a priority urban growth area for the region.
- It was unique as it had three main land interests working together with Council to progress the plan change to deliver 6,000 much needed houses for the region as well as providing housing to the Tumu Kaituna 14 Trust beneficial owners and their whanau.
- The Trust along with Carrus Holdings had recommenced the plan change programme this year and were focused and committed to getting it prepared and notified as soon as possible. Having the change notified and going through the regulatory processes was critical to enable infrastructure funding discussions to be undertaken with government. Until it was notified there was little basis for the discussions.
- Since the plan change submissions had closed, the government had been announced its new direction for water services delivery and the repeal of the three waters legislation on which the LTP was based and only notified water expenditure for the first two years, which they now understand that Council would include three waters capital and operational expenditure for 10 years.
- The land owners seek that the three waters network infrastructure necessary for Te Tumu be included in the final LTP. If Council were not to do that due to balance sheet constraints, they request that the three waters network infrastructure project for Te Tumu that were unfunded in the LTP be itemised in the LTP so they could be included in a proposed city deal between Council and the government and/or be picked up by the governments new local waters proposal. This was critical as the LTP provided a signal of what was needed and with the commitment by the land owners to progress the plan change it provided an important bookmark for future discussions on funding.
- Mr Short noted a recent article in the Bay of Plenty times which outlined the Tauranga housing shortage and the Te Tumu development being critical to plug the gap and noted that they supported it.

- Mr Ford noted the fundamental points of the rezoning of the land was critical and had met with Council officers for the second time this year on 9 February 2024 and stressed the importance to rezone the land which was able to be done with conditions applied to the rezoning in a 2 stage approach and not full consenting of everything.
- They would go through each area and comply and need to updated their submission and fast track the change so Council could notify the rezoning while the Commissioners were still in power.
- This could be done but would require some active and accelerated processing to achieve. Without the rezoning there were a number of issues where the Minister would look at funding for that zoned land.
- The proposal had been going since 2017 when a relationship agreement was signed and not a lot of progress had been made.
- Requested Commissioners to reinforce to staff to consider the reports they received so far and advise how they could be updated and to see how it could be actively have it notified.

In response to questions

- In response to a query as to why the developers were worried that an elected council would not pursue Te Tumu and why it was important that the plan change be notified while Commissioners were still here, it was noted that the biggest worry was that there had not been enough active processing of the application and had been ongoing for years. Last year they were given a timeframe and then in September 2023 they had received a bombshell that it was to be pushed out due to legal advice provided to Council. They felt that this needed to be reviewed and a second opinion sought.
- Commissioner Tolley noted that while the understand the frustration, but now as the work had recommenced in earnest now that that plan change 33 had progressed and would continue through into the elected council.
- The workstream was too slow and needed to be pushed quicker to achieve and was critical to have it notified so they could go to central government with land that had been notified to strengthen the case as the new government were looking to actively provide housing. The proposal was for 6,000 houses but without government support, Council would be struggling to come to terms with the financing. However, if it was notified rezone there would be a strong case for advancing all of the funding. They were concerned about further delays with the upcoming elections and the education of Councillors as it was unknown what make up would be it was a big risk. This was a big project and without certainty it was going nowhere.
- Commissioner Tolley noted that no one was expecting or promising money on the table, but that Council were looking at ways to enable and speed up the process and different ways to fund.
- Mr Ford noted it was not just picking up money and until there was certainty landowners could not do anything as all they had was land so were unable to go to financiers to build. Access could be conditioned for rezoning and worked through the, but they had to get the first lot done and consented with conditions.
- An independent mediator had been appointed to chair proceedings from now on and to keep it going at a pace that the Trust were comfortable with was important and meet on a regular basis.
- Scott Adams noted that they needed more than a mediator they needed someone to aggressively drive the plan change to notification with a skill base to explore all options coming out of 100 day government plan, to push forward because of the need to move on to the next stage
- Commissioner Tolley noted that while they understood this, the Commissioners role was to protect ratepayers and they could not incur the risks on their behalf and legal opinions were important and advised the submitters that they were most welcome to get their own legal opinion.

(39) Sub ID: 1528 – Logan Rainy, Property Council New Zealand, John Murphy - online**Key points**

- Mr Murphy noted that he was here to protect the ratepayers, with property being the largest industry in the Bay of Plenty.
- Appreciate the Commissioners working towards a better outcome and putting Tauranga on a better path.
- In favour of the approach towards a community stadium and the SmartTrip loading pricing.
- Concern regarding the rating differential, as the changes would set Tauranga back a few years.
- Strongly oppose separating industrial and residential as it would have a detrimental effect and outcome across the city and needed to be across the board.
- Unfair for industrial properties to pay an unfair share and disproportional amount.
- It would be double dipping as industrial users already pay road taxes and transport costs. There was no evidence industry impacted on infrastructure such as wastewater and roading.
- Higher rating differentials – it was disappointing seeing Council opposing this with businesses already under pressures over the years and with labour shortages it being passed back to businesses and Council trying to avoid these.
- There would be some excessive increases of up to \$600,000 and could not see how that was fair on businesses.
- Pass costs on to the community not industry as it would force people to go inland from Waikato which was not what was wanted or to have higher costs across the city. Instead of continuing a staged reduction to remove or reduce industry, there was a need to focus on those two points.

In response to questions

- Commissioners noted that there was already a differential for commercial and now there would be one for industrial. Tauranga communities rate was lower than Hamilton and many other metros.
- If the increase fell back on residential ratepayers it would add to what were some of the highest house prices and rentals in the country in an area where income was less than national average. It was not a rich residential community to pay all of the costs for a growing city. In the past there had been great support from the commercial sector with the introduction of the differential rate.
- Mr Rainy noted that the starting point from the sector which had championed a lot of work and investment in the last few years and was a point of difference this time is the structure of how done. Transport argue that industrial properties make a solid contribution in other ways such as road tolls and while there was a willingness to make a contribution, the concerns were around the way it was structured.
- Commissioners noted that people did not realise how much Council put into the state highway system, which was a huge resource as we go along. The latest update included work that Council had to fund first before the state highway improvements were put in.
- A note had been made to talk about the Transport System Plan (TSP) and to ensure that the Council were not double dipping. The basis for the industrial rate was largely based on the transport system and heavy industry on the roading systems.
- Mr Rainey also noted the submission in favour of alternative funding tools for alternative transport and special purpose vehicles and appreciated the offer to relook at the Transport Systems Plan.
- Commissioners noted that they were happy to have a wider conversation at another date about other issues the group interested in.

At 5.49pm the meeting adjourned to be reconvened on Tuesday 13 February 2024 at 1.00 pm

Commissioner Shad Rolleston gave a karakia to end this days meeting.

Continuation of meeting – Tuesday, 13 February 2023 at 1pm

PRESENT: Commission Chair Anne Tolley (Chairperson), Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston, Commissioner Stephen Selwood, Commissioner Bill Wasley

IN ATTENDANCE: Marty Grenfell (Chief Executive), Paul Davidson (Chief Financial Officer), Barbara Dempsey (General Manager: Community Services), Nic Johansson (Head of Transport), Christine Jones (General Manager: Strategy, Growth & Governance), Alastair McNeill (General Manager: Corporate Services), Gareth Wallis (General Manager: City Development & Partnerships), Josh Logan (Team Leader: Corporate Planning), Ella Quarmby (Corporate Planning Intern), Coral Hair (Manager: Democracy & Governance Services), Shaleen Narayan (Team Leader: Governance Services), Anahera Dinsdale (Governance Advisor)

11.1 2024-2034 Long-term Plan – Hearings *(continued)*

(40) Sub ID: 1522 – Ian Glover, Aidy Banderveke, Donal Boil, Bevan Woods, Mount Maunganui Aquatic Centre

Key points

- Mount Maunganui Aquatic Centre Trust (MMACT) was established in 2011 with a vision to upgrade and promote the Mount Maunganui College (MMC) Swimming Pool. In 2013 MMACT and BayVenues presented a proposal to the then Mayor, Stewart Crosby to instal a 51m by 25m pool in the existing area which would cost approximately \$10m. However Council had planned to develop BayWave and the proposal was dismissed.
- The Aquatic Centre heated the outdoor pool to allow year round operation.
- The relationship between Mount Maunganui Aquatic Centre Trust and Mount Maunganui College was well established.
- MMC and Ministry of Education strongly support the MMACT proposal. It was noted that Ministry of Education documents clearly state that school pools should involve community groups.
- The MMC Board of Trustees support the proposal.
- It was noted that the pool location had good accessibility for the public along with newly built 85 space carpark adjacent to the park. The public opening hours of the pool would be after school hours, meaning parking shouldn't be an issue.
- The pool use had grown and was now running at maximum capacity.
- Concern raised around pool infrastructure now passed used by date.
- A new pool would accommodate more sports and events and believed this pool was a valuable asset to the Tauranga Aquatic network.

In response to questions

- MMACT were currently in discussion with Council staff and Bay Venues.

(41) Sub ID: 1020 - Jade Kent, Film Bay of Plenty**Key points**

- Bay of Plenty had a diverse array of breath taking locations and film stars like Cliff Curtis. Though Bay of Plenty was an emerging location, Film BOP was progressing towards maturity.
- The Film Office worked behind the scenes to ensure the Producers had everything needed like permits, catering, accommodation, co-ordinating with local iwi etc.
- Bay of Plenty would be the first region in North Island of NZ to offer a Screen Incentive and this was about enticing the film industry to film in Bay of Plenty.
- The Screen Canterbury Incentive saw a 77% increase of filming in their region. Taupo's incentive saw a 17% return on investment for an investment of \$50,000.
- It was noted that incentives saw an influx of visitors and tourism due to movie exposure meaning economic drive. Matamata and it's Hobbiton Village being a prime example.
- It was noted that film induced tourism created job opportunities.
- The screen incentive was a separate investment from operational funding. A screen incentive allowed for region to be on a global map for production opportunities.
- The goal was for all Council's in Bay of Plenty investing in the Screen Incentive. It's about collaboration, economic growth and community.

In response to questions

- The Screen Incentive requested \$250,000 over the 3 years and received \$50,000 last year.

(42) Sub ID: 467 - Emma Jones, Clear the Air Mount Maunganui**Key points**

- Did not attend.

(43) Sub ID: 1365 - Kenneth Purser**Key points**

- Did not attend.

(44) Sub ID: 1282 - Mikael Carter, Western Bay of Plenty Cricket**Key points**

- Asked that Council thoroughly reconsider the Sports Field and Facilities user pays proposal.
- Concerned that the proposal was developed without the understanding and necessary investigation to make it feasible or sensible.
- The use of sports fields and facilities contribute to mental and physical health.
- The proposed increase of fee's could disengage an active community.
- Expressed an understanding that there was cost for maintenance of fields.
- Expressed that Council lacked community awareness and could not ask Sport Clubs and Groups for money they did not have.
- Considered the negative effects if the sports groups did not or could not pay.

(45) Sub ID: 1446 - Claudia West, Kate Grove-Pacino, Mount Business Association**Key points**

- Expressed concerns of the Street Dining Policy and submits to Council that more work was needed to make this policy practical and fair for all the Mount Business main users.
- Expressed concern of engagement with Council staff and Mount Business Association (MBA) about planned upgrades of Coronation Park. MBA were key stakeholders and reiterated that they would like more involvement.
- Highlighted that MBA were involved with Council for Mount Maunganui storm water.

Suggested that Council staff worked in silo between divisions alongside MBA to look at best outcomes for everyone.

- Acknowledged Paul Mason on his work with MBA on Security. With Social housing in place at some hotels, there has since been an increase in crime. Making sure of security work with TCC and Police. Asked if Council could consider potential of funding for street ambassadors at the Mount over Summer period.
- Applaud Council for marine parade walkway.
- Funding for safer spaces and service lanes.
- Expressed concerns regarding Plan Change 33 in City Centre density changes from 12 metres to 22 metres.

(46) Sub ID: 1429 - Kathy Webb, Chair WBOP Neighbourhood Support

Key points

- Neighbourhood Support aimed to achieve safe, resilient and connected communities.
- Spoke in support of Council's Safer Community action and investment plan and wanted to ensure it was properly resourced and funded.
- Neighbourhood Support connected with Section 4 – safe neighbourhoods, 6 – Safety Agencies working together and 8 which talked of the measures of success in the Action and Investment Plan.
- Neighbourhood Support ran an Event, Sirens and services and koha ice cream day, though the weather was wet, 1,500 people supported the event that was funded by Council. In discussion with Council to continue these events that were consistent with the action and investment plan.
- Working with Socialink, Community insights division mapping where Neighbourhood Support was located around the city. That information was imperative.
- Support the partnership between Council and Neighbourhood Support.

In response to questions

- Thanked for good work and acknowledged they were volunteers.
- The mapping done was integrated in the Council Community Development tea Vital Updates Programme.

(47) Sub ID: 1521 - Chris Toms, Terminals New Zealand

Key points

- Did not attend.

(48) Sub ID: 1087 - Heidi Hughes, The Wednesday Challenge

Key points

- Noted the Wednesday Challenge was not a community organisation or Trust and do not apply to community funding and grants.
- Acknowledged Wednesday Challenge could be considered a mode shift consultancy.
- Supported Council's proposed congestion charge and expressed concern around work done to ensure public transport was part of the proposal.
- Hugely engaged program across city in 2022 with 10% of community involvement. This program was maintained in 2023 with 63 businesses having participated in Wednesday Challenge and Tauranga City Council placing fourth.
- Survey results showed that 83% of businesses would like to participate this year.
- The applied funding for 2024 was to cover basic costs as program was nation-wide.
- Premise of the challenge was to encourage shift of habits to use other modes of transport.
- The Wednesday Challenge seek funding to pay the licence fee for the app used for the Challenge.
- Noted they were in discussion with Bay of Plenty Regional Council to fund the licence for the Wednesday Challenge school program.

In response to questions

- \$25,000 contribution was for a city licence and the entire city to participate in the challenge as businesses.

(49) Sub ID: 1576 - Tim Jackson and Tane Cook, Turning Point Trust**Key points**

- Mr Jackson quoted a whakatauki
- Noted there were a group present in support of Turning Point Trust.
- Had been a tenant in the Historic Village since the year 2000 and occupied many different buildings within the Village.
- Noted there was a period when Council did not maintain the Historic Village and Council had now stepped up and spent a lot of time, energy and money upgrading the Village.
- Noted the 2020 Strategic Plan seemed to be a move towards favouring venues over leasable spaces for businesses.
- Turning Point Trust had lost two other spaces prior to this and believed leasable spaces were at a loss for community groups like them.
- Believed Council were favouring revenue over community development.
- Proposed to Commissioners to leave a legacy that did not push community and well being groups.
- Proposed rates were going to have a significant impact on Turning Point Trust and could mean they would have to leave the Historic Village after 24 years occupying the space.
- Noted a cloak was placed by Kaumatua of Tauranga Moana to the space within Historic Village to allow a space for people to grow and strengthen themselves.
- Closed with a whakatauki about being able to understand each other, will then allow true reality of unity to begin.

(50) Sub ID: 1323 - Paul Goodall, Western Bay of Plenty Softball Association**Key points**

- Softball and Baseball was a great family sport. Currently played at Carlton Reserve which had built in baseball fields and facilities like public toilets.
- The Council contributions included mowing etc.
- The proposed User Pay's fee's would be a \$45k additional cost. Concerned that the increased costs would close the sport organisation. The current work budget for Softball Association was \$20k and that was mostly sources from fees.
- The Softball Association had plans to build club rooms there.
- Noted teams travelled from Rotorua and Whakatane.
- Asked for fair and equitable fee increases.

(51) Sub ID: 1532 - Nathan York, Bluehaven Group**Key points**

- Suggested more community parks in Papamoa outside of Tauranga city centre.
- Urban area, noted it was important to have acknowledge the Sands as a town centre.
- Bluehaven accept and acknowledge the investment into city centre but did not agree to the extent of investment compared to other areas of Tauranga.
- It would be useful for the user pay's proposal as long as service was the same for all.
- Supported Te Tumu development. Would like further consideration and information on targeted rates assessment.

In response to questions

- Noted the road pricing was Central Government lead.

(52) Sub ID: 1088 - Richard Kluit, Ōtūmoetai Sports and Recreation Club Inc and Bowls Matua Inc**Key points**

- Submission was in regards to charges being proposed for Council leased facilities.
- Expressed concern on the LTP Submission time restraints put on sports club to submit a thorough and meaningful submission.
- Noted he was involved with public meetings and submissions for 2005, 2007, 2012 and 2019 Active Reserves and Management Plans, maintained an interest in a 2021 Community Facilities Investment Plan and 2023/2033 Reserves and open Space Investment Plan. 2023.2050 Otumoetai Investment Plan.
- Noted that until 10 years, there were six monthly meeting hosted by TCC and Sport Bay of Plenty for Sport Facility Users and Spaces.
- Noted there were no element of consultation with facility and land occupiers and no indication that a significant charge increase would be introduced.
- Noted that this was a chance for Council and Community to share information and plans.
- TCC funded the public toilets and gave a letter of support to the Clubs which was instrumental in securing public and community funding.
- The intended charges would have considerable impact on users. TCC would take over ownership of facility that was currently volunteer run.
- Recommended the proposed charges be deferred to allow consultation with community.

(53) Sub ID: 1270 - Matthew King and Warwick Brew, Ōtūmoetai Tennis Club**Key points**

- Had leased Bellevue Park since 1990 and pay a peppercorn rental due to providing a service to the community.
- Over 500 members at the Tennis Club that was accessible to public every day. 300 of these were junior members.
- Noted they were one of the largest and best tennis club facilities in Aotearoa.
- Expressed great concern to the 4000% increase to user fees and charges.
- Noted that the duty of Council under LGA to provide for economic, social and culture wellbeing to the community.
- Noted the Tennis club run the club through a core group of volunteers.
- Council funds \$0 to the current operation of the club and only provide land.
- Concern raised about the need to increase membership fees and this could further prevent some families from joining. The current fees were quite low compared to other clubs countrywide.
- Rely heavily on community grant funding for capital expenditure, maintenance and resources.
- There was currently a decline in community funding and it was tracking downwards.
- Proposed an alternative was to charge lease on valuation based to charge on dripline of the building.
- Great relationship with Council since 1990.

(54) Sub ID: 1275 - Kent Lendrum, Mount Maunganui Tennis Club**Key points**

- Agreed with Ōtūmoetai Tennis Club comments as above.
- The Clubs first reaction was that the proposed User Pay's Fees were going to impact membership fees and membership.
- Concerned that the proposal could discourage youth from doing an outdoor activity when we should be encouraging youth to play sports.

- Club members were aged from 4 to 84 years old.
- The tennis club was not for profit.
- The club was 100% self-sufficient through membership and community grants.
- Members who played two sports were concerned that increases could mean they would need to choose one sport due to affordability.
- The proposed increase of rates was well over 30 times of their current lease rate.
- \$100 per member increase of membership.
- Queried how the lease would apply to publicly used courts and the six courts that Mount Maunganui Tennis Club would inherit from Netball Association.

(55) Sub ID: 1512 - Robert Naumann, Tennis Western BOP

Key points

- Tennis Western Bay were the umbrella organisation of all Tennis Club and represents them on a Regional and National stage.
- Clearly the User Pays Fees charges was a financial issue.
- Tennis was a game for life.
- Expressed concern on the elder generation and pensioners who play tennis and fear based around health of people who play Tennis and any sport.
- The value of tennis WBOP was it was neutral and it provided a platform for Council and tennis club to get through options.
- Requested further consultation and a better partnership between Council and various Tennis Clubs in Bay of Plenty.

In response to questions

- Thanked for attending.

At 2.25pm the meeting adjourned.

At 3pm the meeting reconvened

(56) Sub ID: 1432 - Alida Shanks and Karen Walters, WaiBOP Football

Key points

- The proposed User Pays fee model would have a significant impact on Football.
- Proposed model would cost an excess of \$600,000 per year which was not fair especially while there is a cost of living crisis.
- Believed this model would affect kids playing sports and would see a decline in playing sports.
- Would like an opportunity to discuss a fair and competitive rate.
- 2023 saw increase of 23% in players. Three quarters of the increase being kids and youth
- Research shows that the financial cost of playing sports was a top barrier to participation in sport.
- Requested Commission review and reconsider the current User Pays fees model.

In response to questions

- The per season in comparison to Hamilton City Council model would be helpful.

(57) Sub ID: 852 - Barry Brown

Key points

- Noted was not opposed to Commissioners doing the LTP but opposed to the time and planning of the LTP. Noted it was flawed and overcoming for a substantial enterprise like Tauranga City.
- Supports Councils of exploring ways of balancing the budget.
- Noted the currently rates were low for a growing city.
- Supports the initiative to revitalise the CBD.
- Agreed to increase the development contributions.
- Unsure about community stadium and the funding sources to build it.
- Focus on main things like the City's infrastructure.

(58) Sub ID: 1271 - Maree Quill

Key points

- Had paid rates in Tauranga for over 25 years and love the village atmosphere of Tauranga.
- Commissioners had caused much stress to many residents with the proposed rates.
- Noted the LTP was not focussed on the right things.
- Suggested the LTP include roading improvement especially on Waimapu bridge and Turret Rd.
- Noted that only 20% of population visit museums.
- Car gave the greatest personal freedom.
- Suggested the removal User Pays Policy out of LTP.
- Papamoa was subject to future changes like floods and tsunamis and expressed concerns on the evacuation process with few gaps to get to higher ground.
- Noted the proposed LTP would plunge city into huge debt and negatively affect the well being and the wealth of the residents.

In response to questions

- A proposal for Turret Road was included in LTP.

(59) Sub ID: 1500 - Chris Pattison

Key points

- Background in Engineering insurance.
- Expressed concern on the proposed Stadium. The future stadium would have to host as much events as possible for it to meet the intended economic value
- Believed the transport and carpark spaces would disincentivise attendees to the Stadium and would end up being a white elephant.

(60) Sub ID: 1089 - John Coster

Key points

- Expressed the importance and the future of Watkin's house located on the corner of Cameron Road and Elizabeth Street, Tauranga.
- Noted he was a current member of Tauranga Historical Society.
- Watkins house was one of a very small amount of house museums.
- Suggested a productive working partnership between TCC And Tauranga Historical Society.
- Congratulated the Commission on their farsighted management of the city.

In response to questions

- Bus stop required close for better visitor accessibility especially the cruise ship visitors.

(61) Sub ID: 1491 - Mike Williams, Mount Maunganui Sports

Key points

- Was a non-profit organisation and a mostly volunteer club.
- Noted Community Grants was a shrinking pool of money.
- Increase of club fee's would drive people out of sport.
- Expressed concern on timing of notification for charges.

(62) Sub ID: 1582 - Carla van den Hout and Ian Mason, Tauranga Gem and Mineral Club**Key points**

- Noted have been a tenant at Tauranga Historic Village for 48 years.
- Provided a valuable service to village and community.
- Were a non-profitable organisation managed by volunteers with an interest in gem and minerals in Aotearoa.
- Had own museum of collected mineral found in NZ and the world.
- Welcome to all ages with a library and workshop for public to enjoy.
- The last club bi-annual event attracted over 5,000 people.
- Expressed the club does not want to leave Historic village.
- Asked council to review and reconsider proposal fee's increase at the Historic Village.

(63) Sub ID: 961 - Michael Batchelor**Key points**

- Proposed fee's increase from \$950 p/a to \$8,300 p/a.
- S14 LGA 2002, sets out principals which must be followed to exercise its right to conduct its business. Half submitters today have complained that Council has not complied with this principle. Must apply in all case when Council is conducting business.
- Expressed concerns on User Pays Fee increases.
- These charges would destroy these community groups and organisations.

(64) Sub ID: 1313 - Brendon McHugh, Tauranga City AFC**Key points**

- Opposes the Long Term Plan User pays fees.
- The proposed 2,600 increase in fees would break the club. 80% members are junior, 20% seniors.
- Runs a risk of undermining the clubs ability to provide.
- Comparison to Auckland football clubs who pay no council fee's
- Commended the many sport volunteers.
- Fee increases would impact sport players and in turn create an "if you can pay, then you can play" culture in the club.

(65) Sub ID: 1165 - John Koning, Tauranga Netball Centre**Key points**

- Current lease between Netball Centre and Council expired 31 March 2023 and had not been renewed yet.
- The proposed fees and charges would affect the Tauranga Netball Centre and rough calculation the rates would increase by \$70,00 plus.
- Blake Park was a classified as a Recreation Reserve which did not match the Councils Reserves Policy that describes it as an Active Reserve.
- Expressed concerns on User Pays charges and asked for further consultation.

(66) Sub ID: 1501 – Jitjiu Patel and Bevan, Hockey Tauranga

Key points

- Received approximately 96,000 visitors a year which does not include AIM's games week.
- The current Hub at Blake Park was integral to Hockey Tauranga.
- The Club worked hard to keep fee's low for members.
- Noted it was a volunteer run club.
- Aware Club occupied a large piece of land.
- The current facility was not fit for purpose and the remaining life span was unknown but the club were working hard to keep facility useable for another 5 years.
- Unsuccessful in obtaining external funding of \$39,000 to conduct a feasibility study.
- Sourced funding would enable club to complete the build of new a facility.
- The Board for Hocket Club worked to develop a strategy for the Club.
- Looking forward to on-going partnership with the Council.

(67) Sub ID: 1414 - Simon Berkett, Mount Maunganui Sports Club**Key points**

- Key benefits include increasing participation in the sport.
- Almost doubled membership in the last few years but also noted there were casual pay for play players using the facility also.
- Adams High performance centre close proximity to Squash Club.
- Worked with Council spaces and places team to expand current building to better serve the members and wider community.
- Seeking 50% funding from Council for the development.

In response to questions

- Worked with Council staff on the Concept Plan.

(68) Sub ID: 1377 - Robert Paterson**Key points**

- Did not attend

(69) Sub ID: 1602 - Andrew von Dadelszen, Tauranga Rotary Centennial Trust for the Kopurererua Reserve Development**Key points**

- Submission was in strong support of the Kopurererua Reserve Development.
- Raised an excessive \$2m for restoration off valley and hours of voluntary work.
- Congratulated Commission for work done with restoration the wetland.
- Looking for recognition of value of the restoration of the wetland.
- Expressed the need to update Reserve Management Plan but does not need to be rewritten.

In response to questions

- Resistance to using volunteers previously due to health and safety aspect but developed a process put in place to assist with this.

(70) Sub ID: 1132 - Nigel Tutt, Priority One**Key points**

- 76% population increase since turn of century.
- Did not support Industrial Commercial Rates Split.
- A lot of support around generally theme of beneficiaries paying. Growth paying for growth.

- Concerns found in community around affordability.
- Noted the encouraging development in the city centre.
- Congratulated Commissioners on their work done.

In response to questions

- Commercial rates parties accepted rate increase and successful. Industrial rates industry not in agreement. Better discussion would be helpful.
- Industrial rate benefits were not quite explained.
- Development contributions – reduction for some case of development. Residential housing that under the residual house prices. Encourage people to live in the city.

(71) Sub ID: 1453 - Robert Morgenstern, ATARA Film Ltd**Key points**

- Happy hikoi was successful. Response was overwhelming and
- Noted one story ready for filming on Pukehinahina ready in April 2024
- Noted they were on track to make a 19min documentary to tell stories of Tauranga Moana with could be a game changer for Tauranga tourism.
- 14 stories ready to film.

In response to questions

- Worked with Dean Flavell but not Greg.

(72) Sub ID: 1264 - Darlene Dinsdale, Waiari Kaitiaki Advisory**Key points**

- Did not attend

(73) Sub ID: 527 - Greg Stevenson**Key points**

- Expressed reservation on current LTP proposal.
- Concern raised on bike lanes and the safety of it.
- Why develop new initiatives when there was a history of poorly executed projects.

At 4:45pm the meeting adjourned.

At 5:30pm the meeting reconvened

(74) Sub ID: 1471 - Phill Mulligan, Ōtūmoetai Football Club**Key points**

- Widely assumed that their club was financially fit.
- Last year's weather saw many game cancellations due to rain and flooding.
- Concerned Fergusson Park would be under water by 2070.
- Acknowledged introduction of increase to fees but disagreed with the amount of fee increase. Community can still participate without being pushed out.

(75) Sub ID: 1218 - David Walton, Greerton Scout Group**Key points**

- Deeply concerned about 2024/34 LTP proposal.
- The User Pays charges suggest increasing land use by over 431%.
- Scouts was a not-for-profit organisation.
- Scouts empowers lives of over 13,000 children across NZ with over 100 members aged

5 to 14 year olds in Tauranga alone.

- Greerton Scout Group had been around for 60 years.
- Expressed that the increase to fee's could be the end of Scouts problem.
- Asked that Council to reconsider the fee increase.

(76) Sub ID: 1123 - Gretchen Benvie, Tauranga Croquet Club

Key points

- Aware there had been in depth presentations to the User Pays proposal.
- Agreed with the User Pays charges as long as it was fair and equitable.
- Costs for the club were paid by membership and community grants.
- Most of maintenance work at the club were carried out voluntarily by members. The only costs for maintenance were if the club needed to use machinery.

In response to questions

- Croquet Club owns all its building and maintains their club independently.

(77) Sub ID: 561 - Michelle Bull

Key points

- Not in attendance.

(78) Sub ID: 713 - Nathan Bonney

Key points

- Noted that the proposed LTP was not done with thorough community engagement.
- The proposed \$20m stadium was not required and long term implications for Rate Payers would impact many people. It would also displace sports clubs.
- The User pays proposal was not beneficial for clubs and their contribution to the community's health and wellbeing.
- Concern raised around wrongly parked cars in Mount Maunganui.

In response to questions

- Mandate from previous Government was to deliver the Long Term Plan which was a legislative and democratic process.

(79) Sub ID: 704 - Phil Hansen, Tauranga Woodcrafters Guild Inc

Key points

- Mostly retired members both men and woman. Been in operation since 1986. Memberships was static with 90 people in a given year.
- Objective to encourage wood crafting as an everyday activity.
- Provided an environment to interact socially and engage in a craft as socialising was very important for mental health.
- The workshop equipment all owned by Club.
- Undertake charity work creating and donating wig holders for Cancer patients.
- Owns all buildings and pays all maintenance and operation bills.
- Higher operating costs means higher subscription fees.
- The Tauranga Woodcrafters Guild Inc does not support the user pays proposal.

(80) Sub ID: 686 - Richard Hart

Key points

- Expressed concern on the Te Tumu Park development.
- Battle of Te Tumu was important to local iwi and the history of area.
- Noted the design work on Te Tumu needed more work.

In response to questions

- Pushed the Infrastructure of Te Tumu out 10 years but land purchases were still included in the LTP.

(81) Sub ID: 1097 - Pat Rae, Bay of Plenty Rugby Union**Key points**

- Disappointed with timeframe for submissions.
- Noted this submission was on behalf of all affected rugby clubs.
- A lot of Rugby Clubs had done their planning for 2024 year.
- Serious thought and strategy planning needed to cover these costs.
- 64% of participants are maori and pacific islander and Rugby was one of the cheapest participating sports with a high rate of health outcomes from these participate.
- Don't agree with the idea of passing costs to members as membership fees would need to increase in order to meet the proposed User pays charges.
- Supported the proposed Stadium in Tauranga.

(82) Sub ID: 1009 - Cherie Luxton**Key points**

- Many residents in Papamoa were disappointed with the development of an asphalt bike track being installed.
- Does not support User Pays proposal and believed it was unfair. Would support if the user pays system was used across the board.

(83) Sub ID: 1267 - Jenny Kirk, Volleyball - Tauranga & Phoenix Clubs**Key points**

- Advocated for more indoor court space. Greatly supported the purchase of the Warehouse building as a prospect for more courts.
- Highlighted frustration expressed due to not being able to increase or accept new players due to limited court space.
- Indoor users appreciate trying to get some equity with outdoor users.
- Disagreed with the increased User Pays proposal.

In response to questions

- Discussion happening with Bay Venues about more court space.

(84) Sub ID: 1361 - Mark Rogers, Tauranga City Basketball**Key points**

- Does not support the User Pays proposals and were currently seeking equitable fees for sport clubs and members.
- Noted basketball was a developing sport in NZ.

In response to questions

- Recognised Bay Venues and sports were struggling.

(85) Sub ID: 1417 - Nika Rikiriki, Tauranga Blue Rovers Football Club**Key points**

- Noted the football club was a non-profit community sports club.
- The club runs programs all year with 1,600 people involved and pride themselves on diversity.
- Main thing was for football to be affordable and accessible. All players should be afforded an opportunity to support and play sports.
- Was not opposed to a proposed User Pays charges. The concept was good and asked that the fee was balanced and affordable for the community.
- Football funding model was a ground up model.
- Expressed it was important to keep fees affordable for children.

(86) Sub ID: 1114 - Gerald Greig, Papamoa Sports Tennis Club and Papamoa Tennis Charitable Trust

5h 33m

Key points

- Two bodies that manage the TCC lease.
- Outlining exciting plans for future.
- Mission was to provide opportunities for communities to connect.
- Developed a lot of connections with Tennis NZ.
- Proposal to develop a covered facility, 6 courts, versatile admin building, covered courts, hospitality meeting and conference. Other rackets courts, gym. Additionally compatible tenancy (physio). Tournaments held would no longer be affected by weather.

In response to questions

- Feasibility and funding not completed yet.

(87) Sub ID: 910 - Barbara West, Ōtūmoetai Community Garden

Key points

- Concern raised around proposed User Pays charges. It would mean a 1000% increase in fees to the Garden Club.
- Organisation was not a commercial enterprise. Rentable gardens were never fully occupied.
- Managed the many out-goings for the gardens from the low garden rental costs.
- Noted the Community garden helped many of its gardeners wellbeing and physical nourishment.
- Asked that the Garden Club rent remains the same with no increase.

In response to questions

- Water was metered and Garden pays water rates.
- Memberships of Society were the gardeners with 20-22 members.

(88) Sub ID: 1015 - Murray Clarkson, Athletics WBOP

Key points

- Disappointed regarding the Business Case for proposed Community Stadium being included in the LTP.
- The construction of the Community Stadium would take away many sports ranging from Athletics to croquet from the Domain and questioned what sports would then take place.
- The Domain was an active reserve and protected as a green space. No buildings were allowed to be erected as it was protected as a green space.
- The prospect of the Council was that Athletics was moved from the Domain to BayPark.
- Noted the Consultants ignored the information Athletics provided.
- Stated that track at Wharepai Domain had useful life until 2039.

In response to questions

- Four options of Stadium proposed and consulted on prior to LTP.

(89) Sub ID: 1466 – (Bruce Inglis) Sue Roberts, Mt Greens Sports Inc**Key points**

- Provided a competitive, recreational multi-sport and services for all ages.
- \$1.8m contributed by Mt Green Sports to Club Mount Maunganui build.
- The proposed User Pays charges meant an over 11,000% increase. The membership fee's would increase significantly to accommodate the increase.
- Critical part for the community to encourage well-being and physical activity.

(90) Sub ID: 1461 - Neil Pollett, Save Marine Park**Key points**

- The Save Marine Park was a group of a few hundred people who strongly oppose to Council's reclassification of Marine Park and many of the issues in the 2024/34 LTP.
- Worked with several community organisations to get direct feedback. A brief summary was provided in the media.

(91) Sub ID: 956 - Pam Heaton, Ōtūmoetai Railway Gardens Society Inc**Key points**

- The Society occupied the Railway Reserve in Ōtūmoetai.
- Outcomes of the gardens include diversity and inclusivity.
- Believed the Society met Councils User Charges Policy.
- Gardening had positive well-being and health outcomes
- Asked Council to partner and support the society by keeping the lease fees at the same level that they were.

In response to questions

- Public liability insurance on a building not owned by the Society, a shed with no electricity.

Continuation of meeting – Wednesday, 14 February 2023 at 10am

PRESENT: Commission Chair Anne Tolley (Chairperson), Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston, Commissioner Stephen Selwood, Commissioner Bill Wasley

IN ATTENDANCE: Marty Grenfell (Chief Executive), Paul Davidson (Chief Financial Officer), Barbara Dempsey (General Manager: Community Services), Gareth Wallis (General Manager: City Development & Partnerships), Ella Quarmby (Corporate Planning Intern), Coral Hair (Manager: Democracy & Governance Services), Shaleen Narayan (Team Leader: Governance Services), Anahera Dinsdale (Governance Advisor), Janie Storey (Governance Advisor)

Tamati Tata opened the meeting with a karakia.

11.1 2024-2034 Long-term Plan – Hearings *(continued)***(92) Sub ID: 1448 - Buddy Mikaere, Ngai Tamarāwaho & Pukehinahina Charitable Trust****Key points**

- In 2014 the Trust was set up as the NZ Wars Centre and they were currently at the consenting process.
- Carpark was to be situated on the lower reserve, but staff had given an indication that Council would need to consider this and had asked for a business plan.
- In parallel with Bay Park to do a quantity survey to get costs and making sure that the parking space was entered into the LTP for consideration so they could proceed to work with staff and Bay Park on resource consent issues, stormwater, traffic and entry into the site.
- On the anniversary of Cyclone Gabriel, it brings to mind the impact on the Emergency Centres, and the Trust request that Council consider making some of the local marae Civil Emergency Centres.
- These would need some resilience assets associated with the centre including solar power.

In response to questions

- In response to a query in relation to working with staff on the proposed timeline and the funding for the building, it was noted that it was part of the quantity survey, and the aspiration was that a \$64M construction programme would begin in 2026.
- Commissioner Tolley noted that there was a lot of work being done with Marae around the use of them as emergency centres.

(93) Sub ID: 1662 – Hayden Henry, Ngai Tukairangi Hapu Trust**Key points**

- Dr Riri Ellis had strong connections with Ngati Para and offered his apologies.
- Do not support some of the LTP so providing finer details and how we get to that outcome.
- Summary was included in the submission.
- The Trust struggle to have the resources required of the hapu and need further resources to complete these.
- Do not support a lot of the LTP, but do not have enough time to understand the implications.
- Support resources towards Hapu Management Plans and would provide more details.
- Funding and resourcing had been done and they had a budget. The Council requests were enormous.
- Treaty settlements had stalled, and it was hard to move forward.
- Reiterate want to be party to talks around and plans underway for the Tauranga airport and should be in discussions with Council.
- More closely on Te Papa and Otamataha to rekindle and enliven Te Papa. The Trust occupies office space on land they owned and were working with other hapu which was great.
- There was a dire need for more housing and the Trust want to work with Council on that.

In response to questions

- In response to a concern by the Trust over the Tauranga Airport it was noted that there were no plans to relocate the facility. While there may be regional discussions being held, they did not involve Tauranga.
- In answer to a query in relation to the utilisation of Māori land and the Te Tumu plan change, it was noted that it was about the precedent of how the Trust were being

engaged and the outcome to make sure of the precedent impact on them and other hapu, before putting in the final plan.

(94) Sub ID: 1444 – Vivienne Robinson and Aaron Collier, Waitaha Assets Limited Partnership

Key points

- Waitaha assets as part of a post treaty settlement entity, they received parcels of land which had cultural heritage and cultural significance to them and wanted to ensure that material wellbeing was being realised for their people.
- There had been a number of developments and plan changes over time, with a lot of time spent on these.
- They had recently landed on a proposal to build a substantial retirement village with 142 units, which would come back to the Trust.
- An opportunity for the partnership to participate and it was of importance to their people.
- Consent had been provided, but a barrier to this was that the stormwater upgrade for the pump station on Opal Drive and Kirkpatrick Street had been moved out from 2025 to 2032. The impact of this for them was significant and as they had determined that building in stages was not economically viable for this proposal with price increases and the iwi having to wait longer to realise their asset.
- Request Council consideration be given to bring forward the stormwater works to the start the development in post 2025. This was a must do for the partnership or they may lose the development.
- The delay was an impediment to the partnership and something that they had worked on it for a long time.

In response to questions

- In answer to a question relating to having neighbours consent for the development, it was noted that they were meeting with Ngā Potiki on 15 February 2024 to understand the issues as it was a subdivision of that. They were hopeful they could work through the issues together as they were in the same boat.
- The Chief Executive of Council had indicated that Council would be open to suggestion to bring the upgrade forward if there was a contribution to the development costs.
- Commissioner Tolley noted that the Council needed to borrow money, which was then dribbled back and needed other ways to fund on the development so that those costs were not put on the balance sheet.
- The area was zoned 30 years ago and there had been an additional yield from Ngā Potiki land as they were not far behind. There were a lot of houses to be built in those areas and without the pump station the development would not occur.
- The submitter noted that if there was not a solution soon, they might have to abandon the project sooner rather than later.
- Regional and Heritage NZ consents had been in place for a while.

(95) Sub ID: 900 - Mary Dillon – Envirohub

Key points

- Acknowledged marae building and ancestors Morehu Rahipere, who had a granddaughter on the Envirohub Board.
- Stadium view was that they wanted to add deep concern about Memorial Park which was a lot cheaper option and would bring more people in to the city and do not want the greenspace used for a stadium.
- More parks needed to be brought back into the plan. The group had been working since 2004 to get a regional park and it was still not in there.
- Variable pricing was effective, but it was hoped that legislation was focused on all of NZ to allow Councils to make up their own mind as it was an important equity issue with

tight purse strings.

- Many people working in the support and charitable sectors drove around in their own cars and this needed to be thought about when setting any SmartTrip fees. Maybe community services card holders would provide some degree of equity for people less able to handle the cost.
- Councils were about to sail into difficult waters with the changes in 3 waters legislation. It was a wait and see what it was situation. Council needed to ensure what was set up would not enable privatisation. Never privatise water.
- There was a lot of pressure with co-governance and how to handle Māori consultation.
- Suggest that Council go back to the documents created to make sure those were funded through their funding plans and continue to be delivered.
- Thanks for the time spent by Commissioners getting the job done, huge progress had been made in different environments and be proud of moving Tauranga forward as a city.

In response to questions

- It was acknowledged that 3 waters changes would not be easy, but a clear message had been received from ratepayers that they had paid for those assets and want that recognised. The government were repeating that and it would be maintained.
- Memorial Park was going ahead with nodes being created at ends of the street but there was the possibility of a court case as to whether it could be connected.
- Noted in the submission was the Memorial in the Spring St Carpark and staff would be asked to look for it. Also the special Maple tree on Memorial Park would either stay or be moved and would not be cut down.

(96) Sub ID: 1105 – Delwyn , Tauranga Moana Outrigger Canoe Club Incorporated

Key points

- Based at 85 Cross Road, with 128 members who had paid a lot of membership over that time.
- This was the 40th jubilee year, having spent 20 years at the current site where they had been moved across road from the water as you were not allowed to build on a marine reserve. This had caused some safety measures to access the ramp.
- The waka trolley was 120kg and a dragon boat was 300kg, which had to be taken across the road.
- Do not agree with ramp charging and the proposed land increase charges.
- The group use the ramp multiple times daily and any charges would be untenable within their membership and circumstance. It would be inequitable with rowing and waka ama as there was no charge for those sports.
- The club had experienced high insurance rises.
- Would be good to have a different design for safety when crossing the road.
- Land was located in a commercial zone, which was a Council decision not theirs. They own the building which could be shifted.
- The current lease was \$2,000 with the new proposal it would increase to \$6,000 which would require passing on a 30% membership increase. The club also pay water rates and maintain the land and the berm.
- The proposal for waka ama and dragon boats was unimpeded with no charges for any type of waka.
- Request the cost better reflect the recreational value the club provides so that they could stay and get out and paddle.

In response to questions

- In response to a query regarding being in discussions with staff, it was noted that they were helping Council to provide a better understanding of the nuances of what they do and need as a club. A new location had not been discussed. One passing thought for

the marine reserve as there was a slight area that could be adapted but it would take away some of the greenspace and the club were opposed to doing that as the green spaces needed to be kept.

(97) Sub ID: 1322 - Barbara Cook

Key points

- The submitter noted that she was a Specialist teacher that had lived in many great cities around the world.
- Concerned ratepayer that the debt was getting high and many people could no longer count on living here in their retirement.
- Cut back on non-essential items such as the stadium.
- Support local facilities that support the town rather than grandiose items.
- Opposed to closure of the Otumoetai pool because of the new aquatic centre being built as there were not many facilities in that community with a lot of people.
- There was a need for another transfer station in the city.
- Oppose fees and charges increase as it already costed too much to play sport.
- SmartTrip road pricing – Covid caused a transfer of wealth so do not make another with the poorest to the richest. The proposal would penalise low-income people, many of whom could not work from home or bike around because of their commitments.
- Tauranga did not have a great public transport system, that needed to be invested in with a rapid bus network first.
- Glumness and apathy had been accepted for the long loss of democracy. There had been a lot of debt and not the power to influence that debt.
- Delay the LTP until the end of September to enable an elected council to adopt it and to reflect the needs and wants of people of Tauranga.

(98) Sub ID: 1493 - Matt Cowley, Tauranga Business Chamber

Key points

- Understand the predicament of local government across NZ.
- The Chamber were generally supportive of the plan.
- The harder Council pushes the harder people push back in an election. The continuity was good.
- Commercial and industrial rate differential – while most people understand the logic, they were not aware until they were told. Suggest that it be introduced in a slow and transitional capacity as many businesses were reaching tipping point for commercial rates and were not making capital investment which was starting to come on the radar.
- Demand for housing had been suppressed by the OCR, but there should be a boom in the next 2-4 years.
- Support a quiet period to prioritise the housing and transport to avoid further social issues.
- Climate change was on the radar with some industrial areas located on low level land. Request that Council work with the Chamber and businesses towards a policy framework and engagement as it was rolled out.
- Do not support SmartTrip as there were alternative funding mechanisms. Agree that it should proceed to next stage as it was worthy of discussion and to get word from employees on the charge.
- Support for the selling of the carpark buildings was conditional on the carparks remaining.
- The Chamber asks that Council complete further assessments on the need for a stadium.
- Not supporting the capex in the LTP with the impact on businesses with \$4M capex in the next 10 years and a lot more disruption with access to their premises. Council

should set time frames for the disruption periods. This would be a low-cost mitigation opportunity to work with the Chamber for one-on-one initiatives.

- Do not compete where the supply market already suggests and put in performance measures if there was an issue.

In response to questions

- In response to a query on the industrial differential rate feedback it was considered that the logic for a differential between industrial rather than average it all together. The Chamber understood that needed better engagement.
- There were opportunities to talk with businesses before any disruption occurs such as alternative revenue streams, working with the landlord, it would be a low cost and help businesses to be more resilient in the future.

(99) Sub ID: 1590 – Mavis Fowke, Senior Net

Key points

- Burden of the plan was included in their submission.
- The group were established in 1996, as a nationwide programme to assist seniors to keep up with technology.
- The use had increased over the last 18 months with the use of digital devices and the stresses this had caused for learners.
- They spent practical time and patience to teach seniors learn, and after the sessions they were more comfortable to use their devices.
- The group were all volunteers who had a wide range of skills to offer people so that they could gain the most from their devices as digital access was now a necessity for all – from contacting a business to making appointments.
- Covid highlighted the need for digital connectivity with many being unprepared and isolated.
- Sessions were held on various issues including scams, safe banking and the like.
- A modest charge was made to clients but the group had limited funds.
- They were located in the Historic Village but would not be able to continue with services provided with the cost increases which would leave seniors with few options to learn.
- Some clients had mobility issues so that was also a barrier. Some do not have people that they could go to ask for help or do not want to bother people.
- The group were strongly endorsed by the Turning Point Trust and the ongoing management of the Historic Village as they did not want to see Senior Net close

(100) Sub ID: 1540 - Liz Davies, Socialink

Key points

- Focused submission on the increase in fees and charges on the community sector.
- Concerned at the impact on community services, the arts and sport which would likely result in the closure or lose of services.
- TCC had a vision to lift each other up.
- The lack of visibility of the changes to the charges and so some groups had not put in a submission outline the impact to them and the Historic Village.
- It was unlikely that the philanthropic sector would give money to help with increased rents.
- Understand the need to recover costs, but there was a significant public benefit to social wellbeing of residents and the balance.
- Request that the cost increases be withdraw and engage with organisations to ensure there was not an impact on social services, sports fields and art venues and the like.
- Doubling of the hireage rates at the Historic Village for venues only and no staff required.

In response to questions

- Commissioner Tolley noted that the Council had to balance the investment made with the Historic Village, plus the backlog that the sport and community facilities faced due to rates being kept low. There was a burden on the ratepayer that had to be balanced with users. They agreed that did not have this right, but there were also many people in the community on either fixed or low incomes that Council had to be mindful of as well.
- There were some areas in the Historic Village that did not meet the required standards.
- The submitter noted that she understood that, but it would make a balanced difference with lots of other organisations saying similar things.

(101) Sub ID: 1511 - Glen Crowther, Sustainable BOP**Key points**

- The Trust was still in position to be consulted with regarding the plan.
- Three waters capex and opex – the government's view had not yet been made public and they should get a chance when the scale of investment needed was known.
- Unsustainability of the nature of plan with regards to environmental issues such as air pollution, wetland, water for growth, ongoing increases in carbon emissions and a good public transport infrastructure.
- Economic growth sustainability was being pushed to limit and was now broken with serious social, environmental and climate challenges making it unsustainable.
- Consultation with local communities and a good plan does not sacrifice people, the balance was wrong.
- The plan does not include \$8M unfunded transport projects and does not address the 3 waters expenditure necessary, which was cost prohibitive to provide.
- Ratepayers owe \$125M and rising, with projects of \$3b for all of the Council projects, which would be higher if they did not sell the parking buildings.
- There was still not enough external funding to pay for the Te Manawataki o Te Papa projects which was of concern.
- Transport costs were overwhelming everything else.
- Some people say not to worry about debt and build what was needed, but others say that it was not what the people they were talking were saying, especially those on fixed incomes with young families and the like.
- There was a need to address transport and congestion problems.
- The desire to compete with other metro cities was the wrong approach, Council should shift growth towards Hamilton as it was more sustainable. A regional approach could reduce the need for Council to invest so much in non-essential infrastructure and direct growth to more sustainable locations and allows investment into local infrastructure.
- The submitter queried whether the Council spatial plan had a focus of growth in the corridor as it completely contradicted the SmartGrowth strategy.

(102) Sub ID: 1351 - Glen Crowther**Key points**

- Support for a new transfer station in the western suburbs, as what was being done now was unsustainable and was needed now as there was a lot of carbon usage to drive to the current facility.
- Support more community facilities in Otumoetai as it currently had no significant facilities.
- The closure of the Otumoetai pool had serious implications for programmes such as learning to swim. The decision to close had been done far too quickly with no analysis done to keep it open.
- Support fast tracking the Brookfield bus interchange as there were a number of runs converging, there needed to be a solution and to give people the ability to change buses.
- Support being creative on elder and disabled housing.

- Support Papamoa tsunami routes being created.

In response to questions

- It was noted that five public meetings had been held in relation to the western corridor, greenfields etc and homes would be developed in that area over the 30 years. The SmartGrowth strategy for the area was being developed at present.

(103) Sub ID: 1489 - Rhonda Harrington, Caravan Club Support Group**Key points**

- Support group submission with 44 others co-signing it.
- Raising of rent in the Historic Village had caused a lot of anxiety in the Village and community who regard it as a personal touch, a public place of historic and local interest and it was a pleasure to go there. It had a long history of community development.
- Scrub had been cleared and the land drained mainly with volunteer labour who were proud of the input they were preparing for.
- The community opened 1976, when it was a place to relax, stroll around and listen to local radio.
- The Incubator was a place for artists to display art and always had something on and people going there to do and see lots things. It has the feel of community, commitment and doing things together.
- The Village held examples of restored buildings that had been taken there, restored and put together. There was a need to keep a short history of each building from the early pioneers and to make niche to live in.
- In 1989, a number of not for profit organisations were the main groups to hire buildings in the area. For them it would be hard to deal with any rent rise as they had limited hours and offer so many community amenities.
- The Mens Shed, catered for a lot of elderly men on fixed incomes who do things for all sorts of organisations. Charity shops send their electrical gear to be fixed and put back into good working order so they knew they were able to be used safely before selling them.
- The Mens Shed increase was huge and as a result they would lose members and have to close down, which would be the loss of one of best community assets that the city had.

(104) Sub ID: 1480 & 1235 - Maaka Nelson, Papamoa Football Incorporated**Key points**

- Thank you for the investment of all of the community infrastructure underway, it was amazing to see.
- Papamoa Football supports a fee increase, but the increases included in the draft LTP were around what was a fair share, where the Council were penalising one democratic system in support of a fair regime.
- Support community engagement as the recommendations to what was proposed made no sense.
- Disappointed at the proposed pricing where revenue increases with costs. If clubs had to pay for the fields not cancel or close them the fees would far outweigh what was received.
- The sport was larger in the juniors than in the senior space which would create conflict in codes of juniors verse senior players.
- They spread out training to keep the fields in good condition and to restrict expenses would be result with an increased use on a smaller number of fields and would be more expensive to maintain as it got more use.
- Unless the Council information was accurate it would go down the wrong path.

- Charging must be fair and reasonable.
- Indoor sports users cost the bulk \$4.3M which leads to a loss, maybe the same could be afforded to greenspaces.
- Line marking was required by all users whether they be junior or senior as well as the lights being maintained across the network.
- The 10 year plan was for fairness and the fee increased go against this.
- The club cannot charge fees for use of the reserve and cannot on charge
- Senior players would not be able to afford to play and would leave a big gap in the sport.
- Everyone in the user agreement pays, and that was what dictates the Council charge. The sporting codes would carry out any upkeep as best they could.
- If a booking mechanism had accurate data they would be able to update an outdated policy as the existing agreements were not fit for purpose.
- Council and Sport Bay of Plenty changing patterns and accurate mechanism for charging would future proof the city, and charging in arrears not in advance which would put the onus on each club to be accurate.
- No club could afford the hire fees proposed, it would destroy communities.
- The submitter raised a query as to how much funding Council had received from gaming funders that was utilised by community clubs and codes.

(105) Sub ID: 1474 - Maaka Nelson

Key points

- As a player, coach or manager of football, no matter what the reason, the investment of a significant amount of time cannot be quantified in a dollar value.
- There was a lot of goodwill provided and if the Council go down the road of increasing fees it would destroy clubs.
- Clubs were happy to pay a fair share to stay sustainable but this was not sustainable.

In response to questions

- Commissioners noted that they had appreciated hearing from a lot of clubs, who had expressed a lot of detail to be taken into account.
- In relation to a comment regarding junior players subsidising senior players it was noted that the Football scale related to the age of players. The seniors were charged by default and was definitely a subsidisation and that was not the way to offer what was on offer. The club cost to run last year was \$322,000 with \$115,000 payable in fees that meant that that club had to find \$200,000 to cover their set costs. The club made \$7,000 and \$5,000 and had hours of volunteer time. They also had to provide under the Act to be sustainable. That was an easy pitch to the membership to understand what get. To charge a small minority and then have to go to juniors to pay \$200 for the seniors to play as they could not afford to pay \$600 to play when there were other ways to mitigate those costs.

(106) Sub ID: 620 - Elizabeth Howell

Key points

- Do statistical analysis on key items and not manipulate them, do it right
- Big decisions should be delayed until the elected Councillors were there to make decisions.
- Had been to a number of places around the world selling teacher training courses and as such was a well-qualified professional speaking for old people and the volunteer sector at Papamoa and district.
- Provided a breakdown of the amount a senior citizen received, how much expenses they had and what was left to spend at the end of the fortnight to live on.
- This was not case for the submitter as she came to the country as a qualified person

and was lucky to have a section value increase by \$300,000 in 4 years.

- The rating system for old people had to be taken into account, they already pay huge rates.
- When the older people were on the bus there were times when there was lots of trouble when some school kids do not want to pay and they intimidate the driver.

(107) Sub ID: 930 - Mary Dillon, Lauri Russell Envirohub Bay of Plenty

Key points

- Not submission for funding, Envirohub was to support sustainability and working beyond the Tauranga and Wairakei region.
- They partnered with Council in the management of pest plants, to plant more trees on private land to increase tree canopy and biodiversity of the area as moving people to nature was more important.
- Want to see the regional park to connect the people with nature.
- SmartTrip was worth looking at as it would reduce the use of transport option.
- Looking forward to helping Council deliver programs as they did that anyway and to improve everyone's own back yard.
- Green team sustainable backyard programme included tips and opportunities for engagement.
- Appreciation to staff and the Commissioners for their support.

In response to questions

- In response to a query in relation to evidence of system changes with places and spaces being taken in house again, it was noted that there had been a massive change of attitude of people generally with what to do. The way the staff interacted with the public was amazing, their knowledge, they were proud of what they do, were cheerful and cared about the environment. This was hard to do with contractors who had a different view from staff.
- The reserve from Clydesdale Road was ripe for biodiversity and would be a place to work on these types of things like the Kopurererua Valley. The value of a wetland that size was special and saw its value to Tauranga as being the same as Hagley Park was to Christchurch.

(108) Sub ID: 1335 - Jenny Turner, Touch Pāpāmoa

Key points

- The group was a not for profit sports which goes from Year 1 to masters level
- They had been in operation for 17 years, with 900 junior players and 500 adult members. This would grow once the new fields at Gordon Spratt and was the only affiliated touch module in the Tauranga area.
- The club do not mind contributing something towards the cost but feel that the proposed rates were too high and a lot of members cannot afford to pay the subscriptions as it was. The new fees would be a \$100-200 per team increase.
- The club had to pay administrators and the like to keep the services alive.
- Mt Maunganui had a brand new skate park and no one was paying to use that.
- The club offered free coaching sessions which were open to all not just members, so there would also be a loss of services being offered.
- There was no one size fits all with the payment of fees.

At 11.58am the meeting adjourned.

At 12.20pm the meeting reconvened.

(109) Sub ID: 1250 - Ruth Tuiraviravi and Bruce Cortesi, Athletics Tauranga**Key points**

- The club acknowledges the issues facing Council and know that they had to be addressed.
- In relation to the lease charges for buildings and the proposal for SmartTrip charges, the group had the view that more detail was needed to be considered fairly and in balanced way for the club and the community.
- The services of the group included the wide region of the Bay of Plenty.
- Square metre charges would impact people being able to participate in sport and any increased fees would be compounded as athletes would also have to pay congestion charges during the week to get to the field. .
- A coach at the fields could pay up to \$48 in congestion charges in one day and would need to pass this on to the athletes they train.
- The suggestion to move to Baypark would need to be looked at.
- Athletics was a group of individuals competing, it was not a team sport.
- There were alternative ways to address the fees, by adding a fee onto car registrations that would go towards the cost of the maintenance of services in region. This would have a lesser impact on sporting codes.
- It was already difficult to get officials to come to Tauranga from the Waikato and further afield.
- Council needed to consider the impact of fee increases as it would have a snowball effect to deliver sports. There needed to be more detail and more discussion to achieve increases.

In response to questions

- Appreciation was given to the submitter for working closely with Council for some time and creating a new venue exclusive to athletics.
- SmartTrip was a government legislation proposal and the comments made by submitters would be passed on to the government to think about.
- The lease charges would be looked at and discussions held with sports clubs as Council could control that.

(110) Sub ID: 853 - Michael Goff**Key points**

- A Bellevue resident, who appreciated the good work done by Council on the Carlton Street reserve.
- Leasing of facilities at an increased cost was not a good way to raise revenue to support other needs of the community.
- Submitter was originally from Detroit where economic changes resulted in a loss of social programmes and added to crime in the city. Here there would also be an increase in crime as the kids would not have enough to do, they may get into gangs, drugs, teen pregnancies and the like.
- Keep activities together to keep the kids off the streets and it would help preserve the community in a lifestyle to enjoy.
- Currently there were a wide range of activities for kids and lots of opportunities for getting them active. The submitters children went to athletics where there were 100 kids ranging from 3 years up to 16 years having fun.
- The Council needed to look at ways to support the community and growth but not at the expense of social programmes and putting kids in front of video programmes or on the streets.
- People would not be able to afford the fee increases along with rate increases and the rising cost of living as they were already struggling and would not be able to support their kids if the fees increased.
- Request that Council hold off on the stadium as there was already a lot going on in the

town and money being spent. Wait and see how things settle in and see if there was support for a stadium going forward from ratepayers.

At 12.34pm the meeting adjourned.

At 1.24pm the meeting reconvened.

(111) Sub ID: 621 - Bryce Strong, Tauranga Menz Shed

Key points

- The group started up in 2008 and was not mirrored by other clubs.
- The aim was to enhance the mental and physical wellbeing of men.
- There was a lack of things that some men could do which could have an effect on their wellbeing. The Mens Shed provided that for them.
- The group had 81 volunteer members and no paid employees.
- They fixed items for people who cannot afford to get them repaired and survive on the volunteer donations they received for those jobs.
- Many Mens Shed's in other areas received financial support from their Councils. The Western Bay District Council actively supported a new Mens Shed in Te Puke, Katikati and Omokoroa and had a different attitude towards community support.
- The proposed increase was 243% - \$7,000 in rent per year, with a number of other financial fixed costs that was unaffordable.
- The Historic Village was not a piece of commercial real estate, it served in many non-commercial ways and the valuation of the property should reflect that.
- If Council want the Mens Shed gone, the LTP would ensure their departure.
- The uncertainty of tenure was causing considerable distress to Members.
- The group continue to support community organisations and provide a real value of services to the community.
- Reminded Council that the Local Government Act provides for support for the wellbeing of communities.
- Request a reduction in the proposed rent by \$6,500 limiting it to annual inflation and liaise with users.
- Allow minor building alterations to provide a separate lunch room at the Mens Shed's own cost.

In response to questions

- Commissioners noted that there was no doubt of the great work the Mens Shed did in the community and acknowledged the considerable amount of capital Council had put into the Village to make it a safe place as the previous Council had neglected it.

(112) Sub ID: 1549 - John Robson

Key points

- This was the submitters last time to address this governance team.
- Appreciate what had been done with the differential which had been pushed further and faster than he had been able to do and from a business community perspective it was the right thing to do.
- Commissioner Tolley's latest comments were looking to the central government for funding the city's needs, but this does not meet the concept of financing as we all know who had to pay.
- Support for the submissions made by the Incubator groups, Barbara Cook and the Sustainable BOP Trust and encourage all people asking for money. Other submitters should have been more transparent of their conflict of interest as the public had a right to know people were advocating for largess.
- Looking forward to the upcoming election where the only thing people had to report to

Amended by Council resolution CO4/24/1 dated 4 March 2024

the community was where they were from.

- At present Tauranga did not have a governance team that lived, breathed and operated in the city was reflected on how could you get it so wrong.
- Conceding that Council got the fees and charges wrong was good.
- Appreciation to Huria Marae for lunch and its manakitanga and wish the Commissioners well as their tenure was coming to an end.

(113) Sub ID: 1341 - Joel Coppins

Key points

- President of the Mt Mustangs Inline Hockey Club.
- Reiterate strong sport for an indoor roller sport facility in the LTP which would become a versatile space for inline hockey users and other sports.
- A collective of roller sports groups had been formed.
- With the impending decommissioning of the Mount Sports Centre coupled with no transitional plan of replacement amplifies the urgency of a facility.
- There was a lack of capacity in other centres for a national competition and other sports which hampers the growth of sport and denies residents of the opportunity to participate.
- A suggested facility had been put forward to meet the needs of other roller sports and would transform Tauranga into a hub to attract visitors. It provided a promising opportunity in the form of a community lease. Bay Venues Limited had shortlisted them, but the submitter advised that he could not outline any further details at this point except to say it held significant potential and would assist with other users who also had constraints.
- Council support was also critical for the premises, but needed to be discussed further off line.

In response to questions

- Commissioner Tolley noted that the Mount Sports Centre was being expanded, not demolished. The submitter noted that he had not been involved in those discussions.
- In response to a query as to whether they would be able to use the new Cameron Road facility, it was noted that they were not involved in those discussions as yet.
- In answer to whether an outdoor facility work, it was noted that they could skate outdoors.

(114) Sub ID: 1135 - Hamish MacMillan, Mount Maunganui Cricket Club

Key points

- Cricket provided a community connection, grass roots sport and diverse opportunities for social and mental health across a range of ages, genders, ethnicities, neurodiversity and occupations.
- There were at least 1,000 engaged stakeholders playing the game during the week.
- The club were fundamentally opposed to user pays, it would result in generational negative outcomes and mental health issues for people unable to afford to play the sport.
- Ground fees were unintended consequences and would kill the sport.
- The proposed user pays fees were \$100,000 per season which was double the current club revenue. To cover this with subscriptions Saturday members would have to pay \$550 per season. Twilight cricket was \$600 per team and would increase to \$2,700 per team.
- With cost of living rising, the members were already fast approaching a ceiling of willingness to pay and if it was increased, there was a big risk of making the sport inaccessible.
- Junior and school sport had been carved out, but the increase in cost would in part be

reflected in the junior subs to increase revenue.

- The submission had not addressed other increase and ongoing discussions with Council for the clubhouse.
- Green recreation space was a core responsibility of Council, and they must allow the public to participate in health initiative that was community sport where people felt safe, had a sense of belonging and were connected to their neighbourhoods.
- Sports role in our lives was misunderstood as every resident was a user of the greenspaces directly or indirectly, therefore rates was a far better way to pay.
- All players were already paying their fair share.
- With the introduction of user pays there was real doubt cricket or any sport would be available and accessible.

(115) Sub ID: 1174 - Judith Priest

Key points

- Supporting the Mens Shed as her husband was the Treasurer.
- Workshop was located on the western side of the Village. In 2020 they paid \$942 a month in rent and in 2021 that was increased to \$1,090. On 1 July 2024 they would need to find another \$4,000 to take to \$51,500 pa and with a share of the cost for utilities it would have the outgoings of the club at \$70,000. The rental was unsustainable.
- The group consisted of retired people who provided peer support, a place to meet to talk about concerns and interest adding a purpose and structure to their day.
- The men do a lot of community projects which gives them a feeling of self-worth.
- They carry out repairs on items that would otherwise be discarded and recycle a lot of timber and tools.
- They make a range of items to sell in their shop and to give to schools, charities and children in need.
- Some of the items including making computer slopes for breast cancer patients, installing ramps for disabled, a new letter box at the Elm and fishing rod holders for the disabled so they could fish.
- The group contribute to the wider wellbeing of the community.
- Members pay subscriptions to belong and some donations were received.
- Their contribution to the community had significant valuable to organisations and people in need.
- Rent rise proposed was unaffordable for the organisation and to survive they would need to adopt a commercial basis which would be in conflict with the aims of the Mens Shed.
- If the rise goes ahead the group would be forced to close resulting in a significant loss to the community.
- Please reconsider. The group ask not to lose sight of having the community at heart.

(116) Sub ID: 1455 – Roger Cox, Momentum Planning and Design Ltd

Key points

- New targeted rates to fund urban infrastructure with an example of a large undeveloped residential property in West Bethlehem with 12ha of residential zoned land as a future growth area. When developed it would provide 120-140 dwellings which were much needed.
- New targeted rates and development contributions were to cover past development contribution shortfalls but by targeting these it would add financial pressure on the site reducing rather than facilitating the housing supply.
- Development contributions were already expensive and Options 1 and 2 lacked detail on how they would be structured other than that the total shortfall of 50% was to be acquired with increased development contribution amounts over a 30 year time frame.

More detail was needed.

- An increase in the development contributions and a rate increase were not good.
- There were site zones yet to be developed not within the Council's work projects.
- A targeted rate may not be equitable for other areas
- Option 3 was a fairer method to recover costs and a rate funded debt over 10 years. If in future changes were needed Council need to consider the effects across the city.
- While it was good to have city centre development incentives there were other options including a mixed used development of residential with parts for commercial activity on the ground floor.
- SmartTrip was beneficial for the LTP, but people needed to understand the Cameron Road upgrade before charging road users further. The cost to small businesses of increased opex costs would be substantial for them.
- A toll on existing road network would fall on locals.
- Infrastructure strategy and capital works for the planned intensive growth needed to take into account climate change. Had the stormwater works planned for the Te Papa peninsula been finalised and made public yet?
- Council urgently needed to consider the structure and planning for other projects and further intensification.

In response to questions

- In response to a query regarding the incentive space, it was noted that the planning regime was status quo as it provides for intensification, it was more around financial incentivising to offset of development contributions and carparking as changes to Cameron road reduces the parking available. This had been voiced by business owners as having an adverse effect on their business.
- In response to the reference to additional charges for new homes in West Bethlehem it was noted that there were concerns if a targeted rate was imposed as it would add further cost on what was already a high development contribution structure cost wise and disincentivises development and further restricted housing.
- The timeline for land was that they were in the early stages of preparing the site earthworks for houses.

(117) Sub ID: 883 - Laura Atkins

Key points

- Concern at the leasing fee at the Otumoetai Railway gardens, making it unaffordable as they already had maintenance, equipment servicing, care of the area, petrol and insurance costs to pay.
- The area had a diverse range of gardens and shared cultures, where people shared ideas and learning and had contact with their culture and traditional ways to do things.
- The area provided a space that always had somebody to talk to for people living in social isolation and was a nice place to connect with others.
- There were many interactions with children and showing them what they could do to help out in the garden.
- Some participants had suffered the loss of a loved one, the garden helps bring up memories of their loved ones, it was therapeutic and had helped people with their recovery from illness.
- The garden was a part of the Arts Garden Festival which was held every two years, with many participants volunteering their time. People from all over NZ come to Tauranga to see the gardens.
- The Cherry blossom trees were very popular, with lots of interaction from Asian groups especially when they were in bloom.
- Today with the cost of living, smaller house sections and increasing density, community gardens would become more vital.
- Gardening reduces stress and provides a sense of engagement and purpose and was

an affordable way to access organic vegetables and share the with others.

- Think of child in a high rise flat, and showing those children around the garden, how to grow plants, the insects, the pollination and the like – sharing this knowledge brings delight to them and the children.
- A study carried out by the Otago University Medical School on ecological gardens showed many positive benefits to people.

(118) Sub ID: 1670 - David Marshall, Tauranga & WBOP Grey Power Association

Key points

- Genuine concerns significant increase in user fees for organisations at the Historic Village.
- Tauranga was a leader among NZ councils to adopt an age friendly city initiative with the Village and its arts and support.
- The increase in the licence to occupy when many of the organisations exists to serve the community with no government or council funding provided.
- The Grey Power financial base was on subscriptions of members, many of whom were retirees on fixed incomes and rate increases would be devastating for their long term survival.
- The letter received from Council of the increase had errors in it. Grey Power would have a 36% increase which was unsustainable.
- In 2012 they moved office from Main Street to allow for commercial tenants and were now in an office where there was no foot traffic, yet it had been deemed as a high traffic area and had attracted the highest rating.
- Not for profit organisations were having to carry the development of the commercial sector and the unexpected budget blowouts.
- Request that there be a higher discount for not for profit groups to reflect their community value.

(119) Sub ID: 1428 - Liz Cooper

Key points

- A member of the creative sector and supporter of many of them.
- The 2022 hearings plan for the civic precinct outlined flexible structures and spaces and embedded a concept of being together as a creative sector with storytelling and diverse lives.
- A thriving arts community would lead to a vibrant city for years to come.
- Tauranga had fantastic artists of all kinds, many with limited resources and creative ways. Time and labour were given and goodwill for others to rely on while providing these create opportunities.
- Arts impacts on the quality of life given by others.
- Sports and leisure facilities were getting their own creativity and passion, but it was stretching budgets and support.
- Council may not have limited resources with many wealthy people across the landscape.
- Help the creative sector to thrive and use creativity on how the money was spent for the wider wellbeing of residents and visitors.
- Revisit user fees all across the city as many cultural initiatives would be impacted.

(120) Sub ID: 1364 - Callum Duncanson, MACH Family Trust, Duncanson Rentals Trust

Key points

- Support Option 3 for a Targeted rate as it was unfair to a apply targeted rate on land not yet developed.
- Option 1 was inaccurate and targets yet to be developed land who were not responsible

for the backlog.

- Acknowledge that ratepayers pay high development contributions and targeted rates.
- Council and the government were responsible for the shortfall and all ratepayers.
- What could not be gotten from past developers should be gotten from current owners who should contribute on that basis that they brought their property cheaper.
- It was nonsense that a targeted rate be for undercharging on the land that benefits. If developed areas had grossly overpaid would that have been kept by the Council, returned, or paid to home owners? It would not be paid to owners of undeveloped land.
- Proposal of Option 1 was challengeable with regard to cause or benefit.
- Given the absence of an Option 4 only Option 3 was there.

In response to questions

- In response to a query as to what the submitter was opposed to with regard to undeveloped land it was noted that the linking area could be anywhere. Because of the under charging, the developers of undeveloped land would end up paying 3 times the general targeted rate for neighbours and development contributions so would overpay. It was unfair and discouraged any development at all.

(121) Sub ID: 1292 - Digby Green

Key points

- Do not support selling the carparking buildings.
- Lived in the city a long time and here when it was small and now it was too big, with too many people for the size of the roads.
- The city was being destroyed with the revamped Willow Street and the amount of empty buildings, with no one to rent. We have a ghost town and it had spoiled the area.
- Many footpaths were now wider than most but there was no foot traffic as there was no car parking.
- How could Commissioners sleep when approving such things when you had no right to.
- Agrees with some of the things that had been done, but adopting the LTP when an elected Council was not there was irresponsible and should have been left to the new Council to do.
- Cameron Road became gridlocked at certain times and needed to be 3 lanes.

(122) Sub ID: 1321 - Eliana Peters

Key points

- Attends Otumoetai Primary School and wants to be able to ride safely to school.
- Provided pictures of good roads that were wide and did not have many cars, it was a flat area and easy to ride with no raises, there were places to cross where you could see the sides and see the kids.
- Provided a table of all of the roads around the school and map showing areas in green as good, yellow as ok and orange as bad for riding.

(123) Sub ID: 1683 - Tanya Trass and others, The Village People

Key points

- Historic Village tenants to talk about the progress and process of the LTP.
- Communities that were devoid of connection were a world that lacked vibrancy which was of critical importance of a cultural connection.
- Weave together humanity, along with heritage and traditions.
- Concerned at not being able to provide to the most vulnerable within a community. There were all sorts of groups at the hub, with the most vulnerable in the Pacifica and Māori groups for some time.
- Provide mana whenua to all and those who bring a wealth of ideas, exchange

knowledge and unblock creativity The gifting of the whenua as these had been places to offer wellbeing and comfort.

- Developed the Village People name with the mutual support and understanding of one another.
- When the spatial plan was released for Te Papa it was different from the rest of Tauranga as there was a high percentage of Māori and Pacifica living there in social housing and living with poor mental health. These people need a community facility that could give an opportunity for inclusiveness, social interaction, learning and recreation.
- People felt isolated because of various reasons including the cost of living and the like.
- The Village was not a place to make a community viable, to take the services and build income to sustain it with social service. You could not do it the other way and ask them to prop the Village up.
- Support people for who they were and where they come from and help them feel safe. If the charges come in it would destroy the Village and a place of safety would no longer exist.

(124) Sub ID: 1684 – Dennis Robins

Key points

- Support for the Mens Shed and wants be sure the Council understands what it was they do.
- They were not a group of old men drinking tea, they support the community, repair items and make things for organisations that could not afford them anywhere else.
- The group kept a book where the jobs that come in were listed. There were 1,500 jobs noted in the book in the last 2 years.
- Last week two jewellery boxes were brought in by an owner who considered them precious and they received a cake for the repair work.
- Easels were made for the Art Society out of recycled materials.
- People get all sorts of items fixed for a price they could afford and if it was not fixed by them in would go into landfill. Most of the 1,500 jobs would have ended up in landfill if they had not there to take up the slack.
- Everything that came into the shed was recycled, including scraps of wood.
- The group did not take on jobs to compete with the commercial sector.
- The most important thing being recycled was old men.
- There was 50 years' experience and knowledge from people who did not charge for their time except to get a cuppa and a chat while the community were getting so much.
- Support us and do not knock us down, hold us up as we feel threatened.

(125) Sub ID: 1497 – Kelvin Jones, Bay Oval

Key points

- The Bay Oval had experienced a busy summer and a record breaking 12 months.
- 24,000 tickets were sold for the recent cricket games which put \$1.1M into the city. The Black Caps games had 1.1M television viewers.
- 50,000 spectator, visitors and participants for the Women's Football World Cup with the Netherlands team staying in the area.
- The facility had missed out on rugby test matches and to feature in that prime time tourism market because the net cost of the Bay Oval was more than facilities in other cities.
- The next stage of the pavilion programme was underway and they were pushing ahead. Fundraising had become more competitive and to complete what they wanted to do with the facility they would need to fill a shortfall.
- They would be hosting a number of matches throughout November and December 2024 and would be part of the Cricket World Cup in 2028.
- The facility was much more than cricket ground, and they were working with Council on

necessary consents.

- The facility was logical as an emergency safe zone.
- The space could and should be seen as much more than a cricket ground.

In response to questions

- Commissioners acknowledged the success of the recent cricket tests, how well the ground was presented and how great it looked on television.
- In response to a query in relation to the construction contract for the pavilion, it was noted that the items had been removed from the contract including the fitout kitchen, bars and the like and they would end up with a useable shell. While this was not their desire as it does not serve its purpose, it was what they needed to do to help raise the revenue as they were potentially about to lose a lot of the funding that had been approved so they had to make a start

(126) Sub ID: 1661 – Pete Roden, Cambridge Pump Society

Key points

- Involved in the sport since 1990 and the building of pump tracks.
- Looking at a site in as in Tauranga this side of the bridge there was a strong demand for a further pump track.
- Pump was a simple way with wheels and to get exercise as it was open to all riders.
- Looking at a track at Cambridge Park beside the BMX track and once installed, pump would become more popular.
- Want to attract and get adults out there on a public facility and be active.

In response to questions

- In response to a query as to how discussions were progressing with staff, it was noted that there had been some engagement with Council two years ago when they had mooted the use of Cambridge Park and adding a track to the area of the old dump site by moving forward to cut the trees and remove the stumps to get the site straight. Nothing had happened over the last 13 months.
- As it was an old dump site, 1 metre of cap material was needed. There was a lot of earth moving next to it with the expressway, but in the end it was about keeping the community active.
- Commissioner Tolley noted that the matter would be followed up.

(127) Sub ID: 1138 – Mark Divehall, Papamoa Cricket Club

Key points

- The club was established in 2017, and had been instrumental in creating a sense of community and organised sport in Papamoa.
- There was increased demand and the club was the largest in the Bay of Plenty.
- They were connecting groups of diverse individuals to play cricket.
- The rise in fees would affect the ability of the club to provide the game.
- The proposed user fees for the Alice Johnston Oval would run against the families wishes and their vision for the park would be eroded.
- If the costs were implemented, there would be a decline in senior sports which would have a cascading effect on the juniors also.
- Council were building and connecting neighbours, this impeded that and the broader issues of health and wellbeing of communities.
- Strongly oppose the rise in fees, which would contradict fostering an active and connected society. The proposed user fees undermine the essence of fees and ask Council to truly understand users and come up with more suitable solution.

(128) Sub ID: 1456 – Alex and Shaun Hatwell, Tauranga City Tridents American Football

Club

Key points

- The group was established in 2021 when the sport had been bring back to Tauranga after 20 years.
- The club do not support the increase in charges.
- The club were supportive of the work being done by Council and the community focus.
- The club had 85 members from all walks of life and were over represented in demographics.
- The club used Waipuna Park in Welcome Bay and had a successful club both on and off field and at the nationals competitions.
- Fees were low so that the sport could be made available to all wanting to play. 10% of the membership base was paying subscriptions by instalments.
- \$2,600 a year was a 200% increase in the current operating costs and was a death spiral for the club.
- The club were putting on a 30 club tournament next month, which would cost \$30,000 - so no one would bother.
- They were a not for profit club and had the goodwill of volunteers and labour of love.
- The social activities were a centre piece, and people were able blow off for several hours which for many was the only true time they got to themselves each week. A lot of the players were youth at risk.
- The fees would cause a decrease of membership base, and the human cost of club. An example was a solo mother and with children who love the sport but struggle to pay fees, another was a case with flag football being beneficial for the dyslexic brain.
- Families were paying for lots of other things just to survive. Many had no dads in their lives and turn to the sport for that contact.
- Please consider the human costs when setting fees.
- The Club were proud of what they had done and do not want to see it scarpered because of an increase in fees. Even a 10% loss in membership would be drastic.

At 3.08pm the meeting adjourned.

At 3.39pm the meeting reconvened.

(129) Sub ID: 1682 – Dianna O'Brien and Hilary Ziparta

Key points

- The petition had been brought into Council and it was agreed that it be dealt with as a submission to the LTP.
- Sulphur Point reserve improvements on the north eastern part of zone 1. The information provided mostly refers to the boat ramp and water sports not to family groups, swimming and land based activities.
- The signatures were from a wide age range who had a variety of purposes for using the reserve.
- Little had been done to the area over the years.
- Two large trees had been cut down and replaced with a hazardous chemical tank which was located near the barbecue table.
- There was a lack of toilets and a changing area and that was of concern. A café opposite was too far away for someone with children. It was a health and safety concern and for the environment that needed to be needed to be addressed urgently.
- In the master plan for the area a toilet was only mentioned as an opportunity.
- A retaining wall was installed in 2020, but the people putting that in forgot that to enjoy the beach and sea you had to be able to easily access it.
- Access to the beach was impossible for anyone with a physical limitation. The could only gain access with difficulty and generally in an undignified manner.
- The boat ramp was steep and slippery, and the submitter noted she had recently

witnessed 2 accidents involving older people trying to navigate down to the water.

- The installation of a hand rail or steps would give better access for more people.
- These were basic needs of a reserve, they were not asking for expensive environment as it was all a playground, just a basic necessity to improve the experience of many citizens all seasons of the year.
- The area needed to be recognised as a beach of importance in Tauranga and one of the more swimmable beaches in the area.
- Tabled two photos taken on 14 January and 6 February 2024 showing a crowded beach.

In response to questions

- Commissioner Tolley noted that the Sulphur Point master plan had not yet been finalised and they would find out what was happening with that and the chemical tank.

(130) Sub ID: 1478 - Garth Mathieson

Key points

- Support retaining the carparking buildings as the Council needed the money.
- The Stadium proposal should not have been included in the LTP or consulted on.
- There were flaws in the LTP with over \$100M for the Te Papa peninsula and the CBD it was a waste of ratepayers money as there were CBD's all over city it should be made redundant to be centrally located as most of the items were done electronically now such as banking, meetings and the like. It would save money and there would be less need to move around.
- Geography of the city with its big tidal harbour and estuary was not conducive to transporting people around.
- Landlords should reduce rentals.
- Advertising a funding target with Matua and Otumoetai would be more effective than what the Council was doing as it was not a bottomless pit.
- Who were in the know reorganising the 2022 local government elections?

In response to questions

- Commissioner Tolley noted that it was a Government decision to cancel the election and appoint the Commissioners and people should not hold the Commissioners responsible for that. The Council at the time was not capable and the government intervened, which the Local Government Act allows them to do.
- There had been a lot of under investment in the city which would now be handed back to an elected council. The Commissioners had to do all of the responsibilities and powers of the Council the same as any council did.
- The Mayor and Councillors would be re-elected in July with a city that was in much better shape to deal with the massive growth.

(131) Sub ID: 572– Jonathan Spink

Key points

- Support reducing the traffic congestion with variable road pricing.
- When the \$1 bridge toll came off, there was an immediate increase in traffic by 20% and causeway had reduced it by 10%.
- Considers the congestion charge not be disproportionality targeted on heavy traffic as they had to use bridge.
- Secondary advantage was to gather revenue and decrease the amount of rush hour traffic.
- The old \$1 bridge toll each way would be equivalent to only \$2.50 today, so envisage a charge of \$5 for both ways.

(132) Sub ID: 1451 –Leone Farquhar, Lloyd Rakaupai, Jacqui Rolleston, Te Rina McRae-Hape Tauranga Māori Business Association**Key points**

- The submission outlines where the Association had come from and where they wanted to go.
- History included that they were a Tauranga moana business network with the previous entity established 2003 and funded by Te Puni Kokiri. The funding ceased in 2010 and as they were no longer funded, the Board was made up of volunteers with a commitment to ensure the survival of the network and that they continue to thrive.
- Financial value of Māori business and the need to provide a bespoke to Māori business and whakapapa across all iwi in general.
- The Association help them realise their potential for generations to come in the heart of all they do.
- They had been told that other networks do not understand Māori business and what they needed to provide them in the way of support.
- Tikanga was fundamental in Māori business and pakihi supporting, empowering, growing, providing, facilitating and living up to the aspirations of their tikanga
- Provide equitable support to Māori business to survive and to meet their needs to see if more support was needed.
- Printouts were provided outlining the value of the role and their core values.
- There was a tremendous need within Māori members for delivering programs and funding, through to other organisations to help to build capability for tendering to pathways and the delivery of future opportunities.
- A chart was provided to show statistics of growth in Māori business.

In response to questions

- Commissioners noted that it was great to see the objectives of the Association.

(133) Sub ID: 1510 – Julie Andrews**Key points**

- The Commissioners were intent in proposing various projects to catch up and want to leave a vibrancy legacy to the city, but it was also about what the people want.
- Not in favour of the LTP as it was not sustainable for people to live here nor was it environmentally responsible.
- There were big financial challenges with central services, carbon emissions and climate change.
- In favour of the new library, museum, arts centre and keeping sports accessible to all.
- The city had huge cost and social problems with storms, floods etc so Council cannot afford to max out debt as many were already struggling to make ends meet.
- Creating a vibrant city for tourists, but how do you pay off so much debt, when there was more traffic and the like.
- The stadium and exhibition spaces were in a different league and would need millions in subsidy each year.
- Council should reduce carbon emissions and do not need new buildings.
- Why pay for an aquatic centre on Memorial Park when there was one less than 10km away.
- Why compete with Hamilton and Rotorua with hosting rugby games.
- There was much to do on public transport and to allow people to move around easier.
- Fear that Council would ignore pleas and not understand that by locking in contracts that cannot be cancelled because of financial penalties and leaving a crippling debt.

In response to questions

- Commissioners noted that the Otumoetai pool was not safe and was at the end of its life, the ground conditions were difficult and Baywave was at capacity.
- The community wants to be a connected, diverse vibrant community which was about facilities and an aquatic centre for residents to enjoy.
- The submitter noted that she was questioning the scale when a modest pool where kids could have enjoyment and learn to swim, and a place to take kids would be sufficient. She had rung and spoke to the Te Rapa pool which catered for the whole of Hamilton and with some local pools.

(134) Sub ID: 1524 - Maureen Anderson

Key points

- Contract with the ratepayers what had been done, the cost, how to fund it and the timeline.
- The local demographics depicts natural tension between elected members and corporate staff. This tension was lost when the Commissioners were appointed, with over the last 3 years Council staff had been pushing and the Commissioners rubber stamping.
- The existing LTP was to bring a full refreshed civic precinct alive with \$303M development for the city centre. Council had defied and denied building a museum on two previous occasions.
- How does spending \$303m bring services to the ratepayers?
- Reserve facilities and the unsustainable demand being made for increased fees and charges to be imposed.
- The staff and Commissioners were worlds apart from public expectation and needed to be mindful of excessive spending with current conditions and a slowdown of growth.
- There had been a substantial increase in staff numbers with farther bureaucracy and red tape rather than efficiencies and productivity. There needed to be a review and rationalisation of staff numbers.
- The level of outputs had diminished over time and ratepayers want and need local government to prioritise water, wastewater, stormwater, roading and facilities and not the nice to haves.
- Support for the Mens Shed and was cogent with all reserve users. the Urban task force submission and the Village and all of the people who spoke to that.
- Outcome sought was that the rates and fees and charges increases be recalculated and the increase no more than the rate of inflation.

Amended by Council resolution CO4/24/1 dated 4 March 2024

In response to questions

- Commissioner Tolley assured the submitter that they were not a rubber stamp for staff.

(135) Sub ID: 1045 - Mike Callard, Gate Pa Tennis Club

Key points

- Tennis was a passion.
- There was a problem with the proposed user fees, they were a community based club that had been there since 1953.
- The club had a strong emphasis on juniors and unsure how to differentiate a tennis club and justify charges with no increase for juniors as the court still had nets on it.
- 50% of the membership was under 18 years of age and most of those were under 12. They could not pay an increase in fees.
- There was no cost to Council with most clubs as they do everything including maintenance and upgrades. The courts were kept in good condition and the rent was for the clubhouse only.
- \$34,000 was already paid and with the new proposal it was a total of \$50,000 which was unsustainable and would not work.

(136) Sub ID: 1574 – Darin Hills, Kevin Tauranga BMX Club**Key points**

- They were a small club with a membership of 50 who were all youth BMX riders.
- Most members were under 12 years of age, some up to 18 and a few senior members.
- They had two of the best venues and coaches in Tauranga. The club had sent 5 members to the last world champs the club, which was proof that many riders were able to compete at a high level internationally.
- Had held significant BMX meets over 2-3 days for which they had received Council funding. The economic impact was positive for local the community as a whole.
- They had 16,600 sqm and would agree to new rate if they had a track at the beach front, but they were located next to the old dump. There were different values to other parts of town. The rental would be \$117,000 per year. When the original lease was signed in 2012 the rental was \$1 a year. They now paid \$670 which they could absorb across their membership base who pay \$50 a year and they also do some fund raising.
- The group were a not for profit organisation.
- The club maintains the track and surrounding area, and pay \$50,000 a year to maintain the racing surface with lime and cement as it was susceptible for damage.
- The club was making the whole district more accessible for cycling and there were far more families utilising the track than the club members. Small parts of the area were not accessible and they were happy to pay a rate for that area.
- The group were part of the first round of the BMX race meet with 300-400 overseas competitors at Rotorua where people get in behind the sport to facilitate that growth and activity.
- In early stages the club had helped to grow Cambridge Park which was more a mountain biking activity track with big jumps and track. They maintain the track to keep it safe and the mow area.
- Request the Council to be open to consideration on how they charge as clubs could not afford a raise and would not survive.
- Improvements made by the club included lighting like other clubs had so that people could ride in the evening and to improve the facilities they were looking at fundraising and approaching Trust for funding which they did not want to pay for new lease fees..

RESOLUTION CO2/24/1

Moved: Commissioner Stephen Selwood

Seconded: Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston

That the Council:

- (a) Receives the report "2024-2034 Long-Term Plan Hearings".
- (b) Receives the written and verbal submissions to the draft 2024-2034 Long-term Plan.

CARRIED

Appreciation was given to Huria Marae for hosting the meeting on 14 February 2024, and the Mount Surf Club for hosting it on 13 February 2024. Appreciation also to the public for their submissions and Council staff for the support provided during the meetings.

12 DISCUSSION OF LATE ITEMS

Nil

13 PUBLIC EXCLUDED SESSION

Nil

14 CLOSING KARAKIA

Commissioner Shadrach Rolleston closed the meeting with a karakia.

The meeting closed at 4.33 pm.

The minutes of this meeting were confirmed as a true and correct record at the Council LTP Deliberations meeting held on 4 March 2024.

.....
Commission Chair Anne Tolley
CHAIRPERSON